

ISSN: 2663-3485 (Print)

JELLE

**JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE
LITERATURE & EDUCATION (JELLE)**

Vol.2 Issue 1 (July - September 2020)



Lahore Garrison University, Lahore

Journal of English Language, Literature and Education (JELLE)

Journal of English Language, Literature and Education (JELLE) is a quarterly peer reviewed and open access research journal. The primary aim of JELLE is to generate and disseminate high quality knowledge about English language, literature and English Language Teaching (ELT) to promote advance researches and the best practices in these fields.

It invites contributions from researchers, scholars, teachers, students, luminaries, policy makers and alumni, associated with English language, linguistics, literature, English Language Teaching (ELT) and education across the entire globe. The journal seeks to publish original research, action research, review article and review of new books.

The journal publishes articles as per SOPs of HEC guidelines for approved journal as this Journal is under the monitoring of HEC.

The rights of the editor-in-chief and editors to be identified as the authors of the editorial material as well as the rights of the authors for their research papers are affirmed in accordance with the copyright ordinance 1962 of Pakistan. The authors of research papers are accountable for the statements of facts and opinions. Nobody at the office of JELLE is liable for the data in texts by the authors. The published papers strictly follow the guidelines of JELLE.

Copyright© Department of English Language and Literature. 2019. All Rights Reserved.

Lahore Garrison University. Sector C, Phase VI, DHA Lahore, Pakistan.www.lgu.edu.pk.

E-mail:jelle@lgu.edu.pk

Website:<http://jelle.lgu.edu.pk/index.html>

Editorial Board

Patron in Chief

Major General (R) Obaid Bin Zakria HI (M)
Vice Chancellor, Lahore Garrison University

Patron

Dr. GulshanTariq
Dean of Languages, Lahore Garrison University

Editor in Chief

Prof. Dr. Arif Jawaid
Director Academics, Lahore Garrison University

Editor

Ms. Farhana Yasmin
Assistant Professor
Department of English Language and Literature

Managing Editor

Dr. Mazhar Iqbal Ranjha
Assistant Professor
Department of English Language and Literature

Associate Editor

Ms. Sumbal Sarfraz
Assistant Professor
Department of English Language and Literature

Assistant Editor

Ms. Tahseen Muhammad
Senior Lecturer
Department of English Language and Literature

Advisory Board

Dr. Amra Raza

Dr. Muhammad Islam

Dr. Muhammad Shaban Rafi

Dr. Gulzar Ahmad

Dr. Ghulam Fatima

Dr. Misbah Malik

Dr. Fatima Bikmaz

Dr Simon Paul Atkinson

Dr. Parveen Kaur

Dr. Enriqueta D. Reston

Dr. Ahmet Aypay

Dr. William Atweh

University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan

University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan

University of Management and
Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

Lahore Garrison University, Lahore, Pakistan

University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan

University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan

Ankara University, Turkey

Principal Fellow of the Higher
Education Academy (PFHEA),
Wellington, New Zealand

University of Sarawak, Malaysia

University of San Carlos, Philippines

Anadolu University, Turkey

Normal University, Philippines

Table of Contents

1.	<p>The Role of Lingo-Cultural Identity in Nation Building: A Case Study of Sindhi Language</p> <p>Nadir Ali Mugheri PhD Scholar Institute of English Language & Literature, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh- Pakistan</p> <p>Farhana Yasmin Assistant Professor Department of English Language and Literature Lahore Garrison University, Lahore, Pakistan</p> <p>Sohaib Ahmed Indhar Teaching Assistant, Institute of Islamic Studies Shah Abdul Latif University Khairpur, Sindh, Pakistan</p> <p>1-10</p>
2.	<p>The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works</p> <p>Muntazar Mehdi Assistant Professor Faculty of English Studies National University of Modern Languages. Islamabad, Pakistan.</p> <p>Asad Ali Lecturer Faculty of English Studies National University of Modern Languages. Islamabad, Pakistan.</p> <p>Faisal Khan Lecturer Faculty of English Studies National University of Modern Languages. Islamabad, Pakistan</p> <p>11-26</p>

3.	<p>Incestuous Overtones in Mehreen Jabbar and Bano Qudsia's Laal Baig</p> <p>Muhammad Ali 27-36 M.Phil Scholar Department of English Language and Literature Government College University (GCU). Lahore, Pakistan</p>
4.	<p>Investigating the Accuracy of Google Translate in Translating Urdu Linguistic Elements</p> <p>Fakiha Iqbal Shah Lecturer Faculty of English Studies National University of Modern Languages. Islamabad, Pakistan 37-52</p> <p>Zafar Ullah Lecturer Faculty of English Studies National University of Modern Languages. Islamabad, Pakistan</p>
5.	<p>Oedipus Rex: In light of Kant and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'</p> <p>Aleena Hussain 53-63 BS English Scholar Lahore Garrison University. Lahore, Pakistan</p>

The Role of Lingo-Cultural Identity in Nation Building: A Case Study of Sindhi Language

¹Mr. Nadir Ali Mugheri

²Ms. Farhana Yasmeen

³Mr. Sohaib Ahmed Indhar

¹University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh-Pakistan

²Lahore Garrison University, Lahore, Punjab- Pakistan

³Shah Abdul Latif University Khairpur, Sindh, Pakistan

Abstract

Language and culture are allied and interrelated with each other as language carries culture with it while culture depends upon language. The mother language is also one of the most striking elements of any individual's life. At the same time, it also works as an integral tool in the uplift of any nation's future generations. Native language (L1) not only plays the main role in the communication process but also establishes an identity to an individual's entity as well as personality building, a certain class of the masses, and a nation at large. Mother language is a powerful element that engineers the psychological system or structure of an individual to secure the values, norms, history, and trends of a nation. This study has been carried out to focus and discuss the four significant grounds which include the development of a psychological hierarchy of a person with the help of mother tongue, nexuses of culture with mother language, the significance of mother tongue in primary education, and prevailing issues and their relevant solutions. Lastly, it is extracted that the first three elements establish basics and enclose the entire life of a person whereas; the last one nurtures as well as develops one's character, disposition, role, and part to ensure the progress of any nation through the mother tongue.

Keywords: Language, psychological hierarchy, primary education, personality building

Author's Email: nadirmugheri@yahoo.com

Introduction

This study covers the lingo-cultural identity of people in the context of Sindh, Pakistan. It is rightly said that language and culture are unified and interconnected with each other and these both give birth to the identity of an individual, group of people, and a

nation at large. Without a language, it had not been possible for a man to lead a successful life. As Nelson Mandela has rightly quoted, "If you talk to someone in a language he understands, that goes to the person's head but if you talk to somebody in his language that goes to the heart". This adage clarifies that the mother tongue is a crucial driving force

that inculcates the message which touches the emotional element of an individual while the foreign language only works on the surface. One can feel the importance of mother language through this maxim. The mother tongue refers to the language which is associated with one's mother. On the contrary, foreign language is always a new trend to be assimilated into one's personality. This envisages that mother tongue is the only solution for any person to get rid of new problems occurring in one's life on cultural and linguistic grounds. Keeping the significance of mother languages in view, the main search engine on the internet "Google" company compelled to revisit its policy and facilitate the users of different nations with their native languages. This shows the influx of masses towards the use of new technology. Google has been going behind the mother tongues of different nations as a tool to attract several users. The terms like mother tongue, mother language, first language (L1), and native language are used in English for the language which one learns soon after one's birth. A child when starts feeling the outer environment in his/her mother's abdomen, he/she starts learning the language from this very age. Soon after when he takes birth, he again gets a new environment in the world for learning his/her mother tongue. UNESCO in its report has unearthed that as many as six thousand languages are spoken in the world this time but out of those 6 thousand languages, half of the lingoes are said to be in the danger zone as the speakers of these languages are not exceeding than

10 thousand in total. The survey of UNESCO further unfolded that if one language has fewer speakers, then it could not fight and win the war for survival on contrast if few people of common language warriors can easily win a huge number of opponents then they can win the war. The report also revealed that as many as 10 languages are vanishing and fading away from the map of the world every year. This is because of the fewer speakers of the languages whose narrators are lesser than one hundred thousand. This is an alarming situation for the languages that are dying only because these lingoes are not being spoken or they have very fewer numbers of speakers. Currently, a big campaign is being launched at a high scale to protect the languages from eradication worldwide. Realizing the significance of mother languages, UNESCO had decided to celebrate "International Day of Mother Languages" on February 21, 1999, and it has been marking the day regularly every year on February 21 across the world including Pakistan. On this day, several programs and seminars are organized to create awareness among the masses regarding the values and significance of native lingoes and highlight the importance, suggest the ways leading towards development as well as protection of mother tongues throughout the globe including Sindh, Pakistan. Here a question arises that do the mother tongues have any importance and can the mother languages play any pivotal role in the development of nations or not? The answer would be 'yes off course'. The value and significance of mother

languages cannot be ignored or denied in any case because the native lingoes are not only the identity of an individual, some group of people and nation which preserve and safeguard the history, culture, religious principles, ethics, morals and values of the nations but these languages are also a key source of mutual contact and a foundation of wisdom, contemplation, and perspicacity of a nation and human civilization. Let's assume what if there is no entity of a language? Its reply is very simple that the humans/ people will not only be resorted to throttling and suffocating after losing their expression and modus operandi of their contemplation and consideration but they will be defeated from every aspect after losing their especial individual and joint identity along with history, civilization, moral, values, and cultural heritage as well as legacy. In simple words, if there had not been language, there would have been a long question mark on the entity, social group, background, and identity of human beings. It is said that language brings life under its sage and influences it directly or indirectly. The first-ever relationship of human beings establishes with the language unconsciously when a kid is still in the abdomen of the mother where he/ she feels the different voices around him/ her. After the birth of the kid, the mother starts connecting the psychology of the infant with the native language through different voices, stimulation, sensation, and actions. The father of linguistics Noam Chomsky named this phase of life 'cognitive psychology'. Chomsky (2002) said, "A language is a natural

object, a component of the human mind, physically represented in the brain and part of the biological endowment of the species". He further says, "Many of the properties of language are innate to be found in deep structures of language to which behaviorism has turned a blind eye". So the Sindhi language is the most powerful tool for the people of Sindh to keep their culture alive and ensure their identity having 5 thousand years old civilization.

Background of the Study/Literature Review

Language is a natural phenomenon that is a key element of the human brain and it plays a role of natural abilities and skills in the life process (Hauser, M. D., Chomsky, N., & Fitch, W. T. 2002). Consequently, the mother language is an integral part of the human brain routinely, which the humans do not need to learn as they learn other languages of the world in mature age (Newport, E. L. 1990). Therefore the kid after taking birth learns the dialect automatically from the environment he/ she gets. Barman, Binoy, (2012), quoted Noam Choasmky as saying that "It is feasible for a human kid to learn a language for the linguistic faculty which the child is born with and that the use of language for an adult is mostly a mental exercise". Levine, P. A. (2010) said "The seed of mother language is available in his or her gens which begin to take place from the environment of his/ her home and intimacy of mother". Therefore, there is a pivotal role of a

mother in shaping the personality of a kid. When a child screams, the mother takes him or her in arms, hugs, and loves the toddler, and makes him or her sleep by offering lullabies. It is the mother who understands the difference between the hunger and pain of her kid. This action of a mother gives a sense of protection to her adolescent who feels him/ herself safe and sound and is no more scared or frightened. Love, deep affection, and care bring self-confidence, the importance of entity, patience, steadfastness, solace, and a sigh of relief within a child. Although a newborn cannot speak at this phase of his life, yet the mother and her tot succeed in establishing a bond between each other through the language which results in psychological adhesion of a kid with his or her mother. So, psychologists have termed it as "personality, character, emotional and mental growth" of a kid at this level.

The Relationship Of Mother Language And Culture

There is an unfathomable relationship between the mother language and culture between them rather these both terms are concomitant and accompaniment for each other. Language is therefore defined as "Language is not only an expression or a means of communication but it is also a component of a culture that makes it unique and specific". Whereas culture can be elaborated as "Culture is something influenced and impacted by the language whereas lingo is formed by the culture of a society. As a result of it, the values and speech shape the

personality and identity of an individual, a group of people, or a nation". A child when grows up, he along with his mother tongue develops a rapport with his family, relatives, neighbors, and experiences the external environment, ways of communication and learns the customs, religious beliefs and moral values in the society from where he gets associated and connected with his cultural heritage, environment, and history with the help of language. Thus the language and culture turn to be an imperative element of an individual's entity and identity in the shadow of which a person can ameliorate his personality and consolidate the various phases of his life. The identity crisis is the biggest problem of human beings but if they have their mother tongue, then there is no chance of losing their identity. A child can pave ways towards development and progress confidently in his life if he has his mother tongue and culture that shape his life.

Bohio (2008)said, "Languages are the part of cultures of the nations and the languages are a particular source of expression and the internal relationship of all the people among them in the society. Thus, languages are simultaneously the performative element and the central system of the cultures". Therefore, the mother tongue not only connects an individual with his particular, separate, and unique culture but it also becomes the most powerful and effective means of protecting and shifting the cultural heritage in new generations.

Mother Tongue and Education

The mother tongues have been given very much importance in context with children education globally for many decades as the educationists across the world have realized the value and substance of basic education in the native languages. When a child is enrolled in school for seeking education, he should be provided an opportunity to learn in his mother tongue which is Sindhi in the province of Sindh rather than imparting education to him in Urdu and English languages, because the educationists believe that a child should be given education in his semi-consciousness language for better results. It means the language in which he dreams or the lingo which comes out through his tongue unexpectedly and unpredictably because it does not affect or put an impact on the psychological power of the kid in speaking and understanding the language. Such kids are in search of getting knowledge, awareness, and understanding the things and they can comprehend and get everything well if they are taught in their native language. The research has proved that if a child does speak and understand the non-native language (L2) well and he is given the education in that language; this child can be a 'parrot' but he can become genius and wise coupled with creative abilities and innovative ideas. Such a child after growing up cannot even play a constructive role in the completion of national and social interests. According to Fernald, L. C., Gertler, P. J., & Neufeld, L. M. (2008),

"Early childhood education is very essential in a child's life hence the recent focus on it is given across the globe. It provides for children whose age bracket is from a month to 8 years". Sameroff, A. J. (1975) said, "It is a period extremely crucial to an individual's intellectual, emotional, social and physical development. It is a stratum which the mother tongue will make a significant impression in the life of the young ones."

It shows that an individual has a closer bond with his mother language and he can never part ways from his language. This language brings him closer to all phases of his life including birth to touching the age of consciousness. An individual having a background of mother tongue when becomes a part of society, he can play a vital role in the development, progress, and advancement of any nation. Consequently, the mother languages can become an important tool in the development of individuals, society, and nations. It is the truth that cannot be ignored and denied. In rural areas of Sindh, the primary education at public sector schools is given in the Sindhi language to some extent but there is a dire need to provide education to the kids totally in their mother language.

Objectives of the Study

Following are the main four objectives of the study which have been tried to find out in this research.

1. To identify the establishment and development of the

- psychological hierarchy of a person through his mother tongue.
2. To investigate for finding the nexuses of culture with mother language.
 3. To elaborate on the significance of mother tongue in primary education.
 4. To find the prevailing issues and their relevant solutions when it comes to the role of lingo-cultural identity in nation-building.

Research Questions

Following are the research questions for this current study:

1. How can the establishment and development of the psychological hierarchy of a person through his mother tongue be identified?
2. What are the nexuses of culture with the mother language?
3. What is the significance of mother tongue in primary education in any nation?
4. What are the prevailing issues and their relevant solutions when it comes to the role of lingo-cultural identity in nation building?

The Current Scenario of Sindhi Language

Sindhi is the official language of Sindh besides that of English and Urdu. Being the second-largest province of Pakistan from a population

point of view, over 3 billion people in the province are Sindhi speaking. Today's kid speaks his mother tongue which is Sindhi at home in the province but his market and external language in urban areas or cities is Urdu due to commercialization. For instance, when he buys biscuits or toffees, Urdu language is written on its packing. When a kid watches television, Urdu or English languages are spoken from cartoons to other programs, commercials, and songs whereas he seeks education in another language which is English. This vividly describes that our kid thinks in one language, uses another language for entertainment, and seeks education vehemently in the third language which is a tragedy. Keeping these tragedies of our system in view, the educationists need to mull over how to revamp education policy in the province. The governments in the country have always ignored different mother languages in the country due to the Islamic State and the influence of national language i.e. Urdu. A nation consisting of people speaking different mother languages cannot play a role in the development of society and the country being away from speaking its language. Such political governments need to think that if the mother tongues are not being propagated, proliferated, or multiplied and given due status, it means the rulers are shaping the generation that is blind, deaf, and dumb. It is itself a big predicament or dilemma. It is a pity that the governments in Pakistan neither took the measures and initiatives for progress, protection, and shield of the

mother languages nor did they remain able to devise a suitable language policy. This time, there is a stern need to sincerely address the issue and redress the grievances of the masses in Sindh in this regard. Another big challenge for the survival of native languages is that the world has transformed into a global village. The means and sources of media, social media, and the internet have rapidly developed resulting in digitalization. The world is hastily moving towards the age of digitalization. Under these circumstances, the mother languages have to remain careful to ensure their survival on the planet. It is also a problem that the most modern sources are available and the same are being used also but they are also creating many contortions and scowl in the languages for which the meanings,

dialect, and constructions of language are changing. The Sindhi TV channels have also fouled up and marred the Sindhi language, its accent, and culture to a great extent. The electronic media is jeopardizing the mother language (Sindhi) in Sindh. Those youths who are settled in urban areas like Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur, Mirpurkhas, and other cities, influence the Urdu language upon their accent and when they speak Sindhi, the code-mixing of Urdu can be heard. In morning TV programs, the female hosts/ anchorpersons can be seen doing code-mixing of Urdu in the Sindhi language. Many words of Urdu are being spoken by them. Consequently, both the male and female youths perform Urdu style nouns, singular & plural, and masculine and feminine genders while speaking the Sindhi language, especially on electronic media.

For instance, the following table # 1 is given:

Nouns/ Masculine & feminine used in Urdu style	Correct sentences in Sindhi
(1) هي ڏسو، وڏو ٽرڪ اسڪول جي اندر اچي ويو آهي	(1) هي ڏسو، وڏي ٽرڪ اسڪول اندر اچي وئي آهي
(2) منهنجو دل زور سان ٽڙڪي رهيو آهي	(2) منهنجي دل زور سان ٽڙڪي رهي آهي
(3) ايڏي وڏي ضد ڇو ٿا ڪريو	(3) ايڏو وڏو ضد ڇو ٿا ڪريو
(4) سنڌ ڏاڍو پيارو ۽ سرسبز آهي	(4) سنڌ ڏاڍي پياري ۽ سرسبز آهي
(5) اسانجي اسڪول تمام گهڻي وڏي آهي	(5) اسانجو اسڪول تمام گهڻو وڏو آهي
(6) هي منهنجي ڪتاب آهي	(6) هي منهنجو ڪتاب آهي
(7) منهنجي لکيل ڪتاب جي مهورت ٿي گذري	(7) منهنجي لکيل ڪتاب جو مهورت ٿي گذريو
(8) ڄامشوري ۾ وڏيون هوٽلون ڪلي ويون آهن	(8) ڄامشوري ۾ وڏا هوٽل ڪلي ويا آهن
(9) توهان جي آواز ڏاڍي پياري آهي.	(9) توهان جو آواز ڏاڍو پيارو آهي.

In table # 1, it is clearly shown that the nouns of Sindhi have been used in the Sindhi language in Urdu style. Truck, heart, and Sindh are feminine words in Sindhi but the same are used as masculine words in Urdu while the words like Zid, School, book, hotels, and malware are used as masculine in Sindhi but the same are brought in use in Urdu in the feminine. So the Karachi-Hyderabad and other urban areas TV anchorpersons especially females speak Sindhi with the proper touch of Urdu language and its grammar.

Ordinarily, it is said that the language can only develop and nurture when it embraces the code-mixing and accept the words of other languages

easily. The words of this language may be acceptable for other languages and it borrows the terms from other emerging languages. For example, Sindhi is one of the oldest languages of the world and it is a well-off language even today for two reasons which include (a) its speakers are available in Sindh, Balochistan, Punjab, India, and other parts of the worlds in billions and (b) it has been accepting the code-mixing of Arabic and the Persian in past and is accepting and borrowing the code-mixing of English and Urdu in this contemporary era. Those languages have been/ are dying from the map of the world which do not accept or borrow code-mixing of powerful languages. Following are some of the dead languages:

Table # 2 Dead languages

List of the dead languages of the worlds
Old English, Latin, Aramaic, Sanskrit, Ancient Greek, Coptic, Old Norse, Iberian, Etruscan and proto-Indo-European

In Table # 2, the dead languages of the world have been listed to know that those languages which have less number of speakers than at least ten thousand die in due course of time. The same case persisted with Hebrew which was also declared as a dead language but later, the Jews started speaking this language and it has again emerged as an alive language on the map of the globe. According to Gamkrelidze, T. V., & Ivanov, V. V. (2010), "A dead language is a language that no longer

has any native speakers, although it may still be studied by a few or used in certain contexts". The researchers further explained that "If there are only a few remaining elderly speakers of a language and it is no longer used for communication, then that language is effectively considered dead even before its last native speaker has passed away." Some researchers said that "The death of a language is rarely a sudden event, but usually takes place gradually as a language is marginalized or slowly replaced by other languages".

So those languages which borrow the words and absorb the same are not at stake and these are getting enriched and augmented. But despite one of the richest languages of the country, the Sindhi language is begging grammar and its impact which is alarming. This happens due to the unavailability of language policy in the country. The influence of Urdu grammar on the Sindhi language cannot only be felt on electronic and print media but also social media at a high scale. This has put the Sindhi language at risk and laid it on the line. The Sindhi linguists need to highlight this burning issue to halt the use of Urdu grammar in the Sindhi language. The act of borrowing Urdu words does not make any difference and it can cause enrichment of the Sindhi language but applying Urdu grammar in the Sindhi language is a burning issue that needs to be addressed.

Conclusions

It is concluded that the Sindhi language is facing several challenges this time due to the unavailability of the language policy which is a must for stability and unwavering of any language in the world. Therefore, it requires the hour that all the indigenous languages spoken in Sindh including Sindhi should be given the official status at the provincial level. Sindhi language should be declared the means of education and medium of instruction in all the institutions working in the province including in schools, colleges, and universities. Sindhi language ought to be given preference and priority in

the market during shopping even in the urban areas. A regular campaign needs to be launched to control and halt the spoils of the Sindhi language which are created by print, electronic and social media. The cheaper and common source today is the internet; therefore, all the local languages of Sindh including Sindhi need to be digitalized to ascertain their survival in the centuries to come. The research addressed that the Sindhi language should get rid of the challenges and crisis like usage of Urdu grammar in it and it must get a language policy that should jointly be devised by the government of Sindh, media organizations, linguistic experts, and educationists, then this lingo will be able to survive for long at large.

References

- Bohio, Allahdad. (2002). Language and Culture: Articles and Essays about Sindhi language, edition (2), Sindhi Language Authority, Hyderabad.
- Barman, Binoy, (2012), "The linguistic philosophy of Noam Chomsky" in Journal of Philosophy and Progress, Volume: LI- LII January-June, July-December: 103-122.
- Babajide, Abidogun&Oluranti, A d e b u l e (2 0 1 3) , "Contributions of mother tongue education in early childhood education", 1st Annual International Interdisciplinary conference,

- 24-26 April, Azores, Portugal, 267-272.
- Chomsky, (2002), *On Nature and Language*, Cambridge University Press, p.no 1(3).
- Fernald, L. C., Gertler, P. J., & Neufeld, L. M. (2008). Role of cash in conditional cash transfer programmes for child health, growth, and development: an analysis of Mexico's Oportunidades. *The Lancet*, 371(9615), 828-837.
- Gamkrelidze, T. V., & Ivanov, V. V. (2010). *Indo- European and the Indo - Europeans : A reconstruction and Historical Analysis of a Proto-Language and proto- Culture. Part I: The Text. Part II: Bibliography, Indexes (Vol. 80)*. Water de Gruyter.
- Hauser, M. D., Chomsky, N., & Fitch, W. T. (2002). The faculty of language: what is it, who has it, and how did it evolve?. *Science*, 298(5598), 1569-1579.
- Levine, P. A. (2010). *In an unspoken voice: How the body releases trauma and restores goodness*. North Atlantic Books.
- Newport, E. L. (1990). Maturational constraints on language learning. *Cognitive science*, 14(1), 11-28.
- Sameroff, A. J. (1975). Early influences on development: Fact or fancy? *Merrill- Palmer quarterly of behavior and development*, 21(4), 267-294.
- www.azquotes.com/quotes/topics/mother-tongue.html, Dated: 18-11-2019, Time: 2.20P.M.
- www.UNESCO.Org/education/education_today/6.pdf, Dated: 18-11-2019, Time: 3.00P.M.

The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works

¹Muntazar Mehdi

²Asad Ali

³Faisal Khan

¹Assistant Professor, NUML, Islamabad, Pakistan

²Lecturer, NUML, Islamabad, Pakistan.

³Lecturer, NUML, Islamabad, Pakistan

Abstract

The research aims to investigate I.I. Kazi's work, Adventures of the Brown Girl in her Search for God (1933), as an encountered discourse to atheism which is portrayed in Shaw's work, the Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search of God (1932). The researcher also aims to analyze the characters of both stories under the light of theoretical framework. The researcher applies Sam Hariss, an atheist manifesto, to evaluate the selected data from Shaw's work and Islamic theory in the light of Quran is used to counter the discourse of Shaw. In current research, atheistic characters of G.B. Shaw's story are encountered with theist characters of I.I. Kazi with the help of theoretical framework to understand the Concept of God. The researcher, in his research, states that I.I Kazi with the help of Brown girl and other characters of his story reject atheistic approach which Shaw has displayed in his work, The Adventure of Black Girl in Her Search for God. The researcher, in his research, also deconstructs the atheistic notion with the help of Brown Girl and theoretical framework. In addition, this research portrays the state of conflict between two concepts, Theism and Atheism. These two concepts have been discussed widely all over the world for many decades. In this research, the works of Allama I.I Kazi and G.B Shaw lead students to be cognizant of these ideologies. Along with this, research helps the students regarding the existence of God in the minds of those who raise questions of God's creation and His supremacy.

Keywords: The concept of God, Theism, Atheism, conflict, ideologies

Author's E-mail: mmehdi@numl.edu.pk

Introduction

Background

Any sort of written or spoken

work, which has an artistic touch in its nature, is known as literature. Literature performs a crucial role in human beings' life by depicting the entire aspects of life: literature is a pure

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

reflection of all creatures and their lives. It is as ancient as the history of earth. In the Neolithic, literature was produced in pictorial and verbal form, but with change of time, and the development of languages. It was also produced in written form. Literature has various genres that enrich its philosophy with their importance and artistic impression. For instance, novel, drama, prose, short story, poetry, essays, articles and plays.

Short story is considered as the most aesthetic genre in literature. It is not only based on imaginative work, but also carries the realistic elements of human's nature. Short story can be suspense fiction, crime fiction, detective fiction and mystery fiction. Short story has different types, such as anecdote, dribble, fable, sketch story, frame story and story sequence. Short story has different elements which are somehow distinguished than other genres of literature likewise; setting, plot, characters, climax, falling action and resolution. It contains all the universal themes, as other genres of the literature have, for instance; love, God, society, miseries of the human being, cultural barriers, ambition, alienation, evilness, morality and human nature. Many of the short stories also have portrayed religious and political issues of the society. The writer with the help of his artistic and attractive language brings ceaseless changes to solve the problems of people and his each work counters the fallacious etiquettes of the society.

From the outset of the world, it

is literature and language of nations which make people important in the world. A language with enriched literature and its wide history has produced many scholars, poets, dramatists, intellectuals and story writers. England has also produced many writers such as, Shakespeare, Virginia Woolf, John Milton, Christopher Marlowe, Oscar Wilde, Thomas Hardy, George Bernard Shaw, and E. M. Forster and so on. Due to the importance of English language, all over the world people started to write in English language to solve the miseries of human beings with the help of their cultural values, beliefs, and social norms. While the entire countries of the world are in race to share their etiquettes, the Pakistani writers with their intellectual and scholarly approach also share their opinions to solve the issues of people and they promote Pakistani culture in every corner of the world, countering the fallacious beliefs and norms of the society. Pakistan's land and its eternal blaze have also given birth to various writers, poets, novelists and dramatists who produce world-level literature with their scholarly thinking to enhance the world literature. For instance, Imdad Ali Imam Ali Kazi, Saddat Hassan Manto, Amar Jaleel, Quratulain Hyder, Ustad Bukhari (Syed Ahmed Shah Bukhari), Habib Jalib, Mohsin Hamid, and Fatima Bhutto.

Imdad Ali Imam Ali Kazi is a prominent writer of Pakistan. Kazi is also known as Allama I.I. Kazi. He is best known as the Muslim scholar, essayist, short stories writer,

philosopher, jurist, and educationalist. He wrote fiction and non-fiction works, but his most of works are written on education, social issues, philosophy, and religion (Brohi, 1960). He was the contemporary of George Bernard Shaw, who wrote a story at that time, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*. In his story, the Black girl freshly converts into Christianity. She aims to find God, but at the end, the Black girl reaches at a dismal conclusion, rejecting the all institutionalized religions of the earth. So, Kazi produces a story, *Adventure of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, to respond G B Shaw with Moslem ideology. Actually, both fictional works are based on the topics of atheism and theism which are broader topics in the world. Kazi with his intellectual thinking writes the story; *Adventures of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, to encounter atheistic approach of George Bernard Shaw through Muslim point. Kazi's response to Shaw is not only a shelter for Islamic ideology, but also for all those institutionalized religions to whom the Black Girl of G. B. Shaw has rejected. The theories of theism and atheism will be applied to carry out the research.

Problem Statement

The debate on God has been raised since the dawn of human history (Drange, 1998). Some people believe in the existence of God: they are called theist. Some people do not believe in the existence of the Creator, they are known as atheist. George Bernard Shaw conveys the message of atheism

through his fictional work, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*. G B Shaw claims that there is no God in the universe but the human beings who fulfilled their own purposes, and became gods themselves. Kazi, the writer of *Adventures of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, delivers religious message in support of the Creator.

He argues that God is omnipresent and human beings are His creation and realization is the best way to be close to Him. He helps His creature on the every turn of life to guide them what is good and evil for them. The researcher aims to show the contrastive discourse about the Creator in the non-fictional works of Kazi and Shaw. The current study, with the help of theoretical framework, focuses upon the extent of the question to which Creator has been described in both stories.

Significance of Study

The research has its own importance as it shows the conflict between two different ideologies, theism and atheism which are long debated on the earth. It will be helpful for the students of literature to understand the distinguished ideologies through the work of Shaw and Kazi. The research also unravels that how the different ideologies have diverted the mind of human beings with the passage of time. The research will be fruitful for those people who face the question of Creator in their daily life.

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

Research Objectives

- " The research intends to critically evaluate Kazi's story, *Adventures of Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, as counter discourse to G.B Shaw's atheistic approach in his story, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*.
- " The research aims to critically explain the contrastive literary rhetoric of Allama I.I. Kazi's and G.B Shaw's works about the Creator.

Research Questions

1. How does Allama I.I. Kazi counter the atheistic discourse of George Bernard Shaw in his story?
2. How does the atheistic character of G B Shaw, *Black Girl*, encounter with the theistic character of Allama II Kazi, *Brown Girl*?

Delimitations

The research has been conducted on Allama I.I. Kazi's story, *Adventures of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God* and George Bernard Shaw's story, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*.

Literature Review

The clash between theism and atheism is as old as the birth of the earth and it is considered as sign of danger for human beings because the questions

regarding God have been raised in each and every era.

Atheism is a Greek term which means the belief that God does not exist. So, it spoils the beliefs of theist people and creates enormous questions in their mind regarding God. It gives birth to new opinions which ruin the beliefs and norms of human beings. One who does not believe in the existence of God is considered as pagan. Ali Shariati defines Kufr as denying the truth or disbelief. He says that the truth also exists in the heart of those people, who deny the existence of God but due to some reasons they cover it with the curtain of ignorance. The curtain can be defined as the ignorance of self-seeking, self-interpretation and self-interest as the atheist interprets (Shariati, 1998).

Moreover, Science is production of different institutionalized religions, so the formulas and experiments which are experienced by not based on factual evidences themselves (Wegter & Div, 2009). They are based on presuppositions such as mass of earth, sun and moon. Verily, Scientists have not measured these objects in reality but their mass measurements are based on presuppositions. However, the scientists still have not found where the soul of human being exists (Wegter & Div, 2009). So, it is worth to deny the existence of God on the bases of limited knowledge which itself is incomplete. All famous scientists have their religions. Thus, they introduce laws of science with the help of their religions

and the scientists who laid the foundations of science (Newton, Boyle, Kepler, Babon, and so on) were believers of God of the Bible (Wegter & Div, 2009).

Greksa (2015) critically evaluates how the collage atheists are dismissed from society and sociology of religion. Society and sociology of religion do not accept their atheist identity formation because they are considered as immoral, empty and ignorant and they spoil the values and more-morals of other communities. Thus, atheists, in United States, are considered as invisible minority due to the dominancy of religious climate. Greksa (2015) finds out the roots of atheistic process from the childhood due to background factors. Further, the author of thesis identifies that institutions (collages) performs prominent role to provide a supportive context and it helps atheists to crystallize their identity as atheist in the society (Greksa, 2015).

The notion of this study deals with formation of atheist identity which is provided by collages, and their survival with dangerous identity that is disapproved by the US society. In 2015, Greksa has observed that the basic reason to put atheists out of society is that their natures are constructed as immoral and they are irrational towards religious norms. Edgell, Joseph Gerteis, and Douglas Hartmann claim that atheists are considered as "other" in the society that is why they are expelled from the moral boundaries and cultural boundaries of those who believe in God

(Greksa, 2015).

The tussle between theism and atheism is ancient and its spring-age can be traced from Greeks. Many scholars have critically analyzed the language context of notions, theism and atheism, against each other. The intentions Bainbridge, in this chapter of the book, is to prove irrationality in the language of theistic context which is used for atheists. In 2009, Bainbridge brings out some lines from the King Jame's version of Bible to prove immorality in religion.

Foolish say in their hearts, there is no God. So, they do unpleasant works and their actions resemble to evilness and wickedness (Psalm, 14, p. 1)

According to religious perspectives, the statement is moral argument against the immoral people who are atheists, but Bainbridge argues that the words wickedness and evilness are afflicted with atheists because they do not accept their mores-moral in their life. So, the researcher finds out irrationality in the context of theists against atheists with his on perspectives and he also deals with Goodness and Moral values which according to him are associated with the religious groups rather than atheists. Thus, the thinking or language about non-believers is harsh and they are viewed as wicked according to those who believes in God (Bainbirdge, 2009, pp. 324-330).

Open theism is a new ideology in theism which is controversial against the classical religion, and the study on open theism is conducted by Jowers

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

(2005). The article will help to distinguish between open theism and classical theism. In open theism, the obedience of Human beings bring happiness to God, and that happiness of God ebb and flow by the action of human beings. On the other hand, classical theists claim that God is supreme Who always remains happy, and no one can bring ebb and flow for Him (Jowers, 2005). God has knowledge about present and past, but He does not know what will happen in the future, so He predicts future through the action of human beings. Classical theists argue that Almighty God knows all the hidden meaning and nothing is hidden from him (Jowers, 2005). The opinions of Muslims-scholars regarding the knowledge of Almighty Allah are such as " Verily, Allah only knows what is happening to his creature in the world and under the earth, and He is only pious and supreme Who knows what will happen to His creature after the mortal life, but it is His creature who cannot measure anything of His knowledge (Surah Taha: 110). Open theism is fusion of Greek philosophy and Christian philosophy, but some thinkers claim that the concept open theism is related to any Holy scripture as classical theism. It does not contain holistic touch but it is a path, is created by human beings to enhance the power and freewill of mankind against God (Jowers, 2005). In 2012, Oliphint critically analyses that the basic purpose to introduce this concept is to minimize the 'Godness' of God toward human beings, that minimization of God's Godness contains His absolute sovereignty over His creatures in the

world and hereafter. Our sinful hearts only try to get absolute sovereignty, introducing the concept of open theism (Oliphint, 2012, pp. 181-220). The researcher finally finds out that open theism is against the Holy scriptures and only talks about the power and freewill of human beings, ignoring the supreme power of Creator Who has created entire creation, and He yields many other arguments, used to minimize the sovereignty of God (Jowers, 2005).

Karim et al (2015) critically evaluate the controversy of Dr. Faustus's character, either he is a theist or atheist in Marlow's drama. The researchers claim that Faustus accepts the offer of devil which is devilish act and promises that he will reject the beliefs of trinity. He also learns the necromancy to get supreme power and sells his soul to Lucifer (devil) which is prohibited for a religious person. So, he crosses the limit of morality and enters to immorality, rejecting the values of religion. Thus, the character of Marlow's drama, Dr. Faustus is known as Atheist that is the one perspective of this study (Karim et al, 2015). However, the researchers also observe that Dr. Faustus, at the end of drama, repents by accepting God as supreme. He says, " the mercies of God are infinite" (line-14; scene-13). He claims that only one drop of Christ can save him from eternal suffering and hell. The researchers apply orthodox religious framework to analyze the character of Faustus to bring back in the boundary of religion. The researchers argue that Faustus, at the end of drama, acquires

the self-realization, and realizes his misdeed which he committed in the lust of power, wealth and knowledge. Moreover, he repents for his sinful acts which he performed in pride and arrogance, and comes out of despair. He realizes that hope and buoyancy can only be seen in God (Karim et al, 2015). The above discussion on the topic of theism and atheism will help to create difference between the both ideologies. The research will deal with the concept of God under the light of Islamic ideology to support the theism, encountering atheistic approach of Shaw which he portrays in his story, *Adventure of the Black Girl in Her Search for God*. The purpose of this current research is to critically explain how Islamic ideology works to encounter atheist perspectives which are raised by George Bernard Shaw. Though most of the scholar have attempted many researches on theism and atheism, yet no one has touched Kazi's work, *The Adventures of Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, as a counter discourse to atheism in the light of Muslim philosophy. Thus, the researcher will help to fill up a wide gap.

Research Methodology

Theoretical Framework

The researcher follows the theory of theism and atheism to accomplish this research. Many of the scholars have given theories on atheism but this research only follows some elements of it which exist in the story of G B Shaw. The researcher follows the

theory of Sam Harris, a manifesto of Atheism which also contains views of other atheists such as Diagoras and Epicurus. Atheists believe that God does not exist in the universe; they completely reject the theistic approach of people. The researcher will focus upon atheistic approaches that God is responsible of all miseries and evils. A Greek philosopher, Epicurus, says if God is not able to stop evils in any corner of the world, He is not "Omni-being". If He is able and willing to prevent evils, where do they come from? So, he says that one, who cannot stop evils, is not a God. The term atheism comes from Greek language means godless. It simply shows a disbelief in God; thus it is anti-theism. Diagoras, a Greek philosopher, who strongly criticizes the institutionalized religions, considered as the first atheist. The atheists follow the evidential approach. So, they do not believe in the existence of God without any empirical evidence.

Theists believe in the existence of God. The researcher will follow the theory of Zakir Naik regarding the concept of God under the light of Quran. He uses Surah Ikhlas as Touchstone method to measure the qualities of God. He says that God is supreme power who only creates universe with His genuine creativity. Zakir Naik also takes help from Surah Taha to measure the knowledge of God. Theists believe that creation means to bring something from nothing, so it is only possible for a God. Muslim ideology considers God as omnipresent, supreme power, holiness

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

and eternal truth; He is creator and the universe is His creation. God is an actuality that can be understood through realization, not principle. Theists consider Holy Books as a spiritual source of guidance. They do not believe in empirical evidences like atheists and God has given human beings mind to know what is good or bad for them.

Similarly, both of the philosophies, theism and atheism, can be seen in the works of Shaw and Kazi. The researcher critically analyses the selected data, using some elements of the theory of theism and atheism. The researcher will find out the same sort of elements from the works of the both writers. Thus, the both approaches become helpful for the researcher to complete the research.

Research Design

The research has been conducted as descriptive and contrastive rhetoric about Creator which has been shown in the works of both writers. The researcher will focus how Kazi responds to Shaw's atheist approach through the Moslem ideology. The researcher will follow the theoretical framework which is based upon the elements of theism and atheism to show the concept of Creator in Shaw's and Kazi's rhetoric.

Research Method

The researcher has followed the qualitative method to find out the suitable answer of the questions. The

researcher has analyzed the data through critical reading of the texts which has been helpful to achieve the answer of the research questions, applying the elements of the theory of theism and atheism.

Data Generation Tools

The researcher has generated his data from the stories of George Bernard Shaw and Allama I.I. Kazi. The researcher has followed other sources such as internet, articles, books and columns to produce authentic and qualitative material.

Data Analyses Method

The selected data has analyzed using the Islamic theory and Sam Harris' theory, a manifesto of atheism.

Criteria for the Data Selection

The selected data from the both fictional works has been critically evaluated under the theories of theism and atheism to achieve the objectives of the current research. The researcher selects the most relevant chunks from the both fictional works, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Search for God* and *The Adventure of the Brown Girl in her Search for God* which have quite resemblance with the theoretical framework.

Data Analysis

Theism and atheism are two broader terms containing vast philosophies in the field of knowledge

regarding Creator, and the philosophies which have been pointed out in the current research under the light of I.I. Kazi and George Bernard Shaw's work. The believers of theist approach believe in the existence of God, Who is the creator of all entities that exist in the universe. Theists also believe that the Creator has sent us in the world and we will return to God. On the other hand, atheists do not believe in the existence of God, and they consider all religious doctrine as fabricated stories based on myth without logic and reasons. They develop an idea by rejecting notion of all religious doctrine that universe is a gigantic system of reflexes which is produced through shocks after the expulsion of gases.

The universe has been occurred through Natural Selection, and that God is fable. (Shaw, 1932, p. 49) George Bernard Shaw gives voice to his ideas through his characters which are introduced in his story, *The Adventures of the Black Girl in Her Search for God*, to counter the religious dogmas. Black girl meets a troop of Jewish army, she tells them that she is in search of God but still she is unable to reach at her destination. She claims that she has met different gods in her journey such as Mamba, Nailer and Micah the Morasthite, yet her heart is not satisfied to believe any one of them because all of them are arrogant, authoritative, and have thirst to drink the blood of human beings in the name of sacrifice. Shaw, through character of Black girl displays the concept of God as fable; he further says that there is no any such identity like God, and God is a

fabric character used by theists.

Kazi supports theist approach through his work, *Adventures of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God*, to counter the atheistic notion which is promoted by Western writer, G. B. Shaw, in his story, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*. Kazi introduces a character of Brown girl in his story who acts as an atheist in the outset of story. She starts her journey to find out God, she meets many philosophers and religious personalities throughout her journey.

"There is nothing like unto Him, and He is entirely above all whatever man can imagine. He cannot be seen but behind a veil, He speaks not to His creature but through inspiration." (Kazi, 1933, p. 52)

They teach her that reality does not exist behind one veil, but it exists behind many veils which only can be understood by understanding his or her own existence in the earth. For instance, human-eye cannot see everything that exists in the universe because the truths of some entities are behind many veils. Veil symbolizes to a truth which cannot be caught keeping hate, greed, and materialistic desires in the heart, because human soul need prayers as much as our body needs food to maintain the appearance of physical feature. The prophets of Allah were sent to guide human beings and understand the nature of creator. Some of them are pointed out by Kazi in his story such as Moses, Jesus and Messenger (the last prophet); they came to mature human

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

brain. So, Human beings should purify their hearts rather than raising the illogical questions which themselves seem stupid and forget the luxuries of earth to find out God. I.I. Kazi critically evaluates the luxuries of world for human beings through the Islamic perspective; Brown Girl is informed by a great religious character of story who is introduced as Messenger. He states that those people who want to increase their prosperity they should do their work honestly and God never refuses to take pleasure from earning which is honestly earned. The basic purpose to encounter the atheist approach of Shaw's is only to save the Islamic belief, but his work performs a great role to save all those institutionalized religions which are countered by George Bernard Shaw in his work, the Adventures of the Black Girl in Her Search for God.

"I want to know why, if you really made the world, you made it so badly."(Shaw, 1932, p. 26)

On the other hand, Shaw's character, Black girl, meets different institutionalized religious personalities and challenges the wisdom of God by saying that the world has been created is full of misfortunes. She, with her atheist approach, suggests that her people would enjoy their lives by committing sins and they will not be tested in their life, if she will God. Shaw actually talks about the freedom of human through his character, Black girl. She rejects the existence of God by saying how one can be a god who cannot control the evils that exist in the

world. The hidden purpose behind these words is to reject supremacy and omnipotence of God. She portrays the picture of God in her mind as amateur God who enjoys the suffering of human beings rather than providing them pleasurable life. Shaw's character of Black girl displays the nature of God as a person who does something badly without skills. She actually supports the notion of atheism to raise questions against the philosophy of God which is taught in religious institutions, and her atheist approach is portrayed by Shaw to justify God as a bungler who treats human beings as little creature.

"Unwashed hands do not defile: it is the unwashed mind that defiles a man."(Kazi, 1933, p. 40)

Kazi, with his theistic approach, encounters the arguments which are raised by Shaw's character, Black girl, against the philosophy of Creator. He accepts, everything that exists in the universe is created by Almighty Allah, but he claims that the creator of the universe (Allah) also bestows mind to human beings as they can understand the difference between the evil and good. If the evilness day after day is increasing, it is just because of greedy nature of human beings. They use their minds to get self-interests rather than thinking about other creature. Mind is given to human beings as they can punish evil holding flag of goodness in their hands, and it must be punished. Kazi, through his characters, deconstructs atheist approach of Shaw by saying that evilness is nothing but the absence of

goodness and it can be observed when human beings give more importance to their materialistic desires, and it is the fault of those worst followers who cannot create difference between good and evil; and keep in their hearts more worldly ambitions than spirituality. Thus, it brings violence and destruction in the world. Kazi encounters atheistic approach of Shaw, supporting to theist approach. He, through his characters, suggests that belief in Allah is best to get rid from the all miseries and prayer helps to protect human beings and keep them back from the wrong actions and it is only way to guard against the pitfalls.

"Pooh! Said the Sculptor your Allah is a bungler; and he knows it. I have in my both in a curtained-off corner some Greek gods so beautiful that Allah himself may well burst with envy when he compares them with his own amateur attempts. I tell you Allah made his hand of mine because his own hands are too clumsy."(Shaw, 1932, p. 59)

George Bernard Shaw uses rhetoric speeches against the God (Allah) of Muslims through his character, Sculptor, in his story. When Black girl meets Messenger in her journey, she asks him to guide the way to find God. He says that God (Allah) is everywhere, but the eyes of human beings are not capable to see Him. On this statement of Messenger Sculptor bursts, Shaw introduces this character in the story to give voice to his own ideas to demoralize the religious values and

norms, implementing the atheistic approach. Sculptor, with his atheistic mentality, interprets Muslim's God as self-interested entity who only tries to get hegemony over the world. According to G.B. Shaw's character of the story, God creates competition with the old Greek gods, showing his power over all creatures in the universe. He also portrays the picture of Allah in human beings mind as self-esteemed who knows nothing without his glory. Shaw challenges skills of Allah, and considers his power as limited, using the word, clumsy. This statement gives spirit to atheist perspective as it is mentioned in Sam Harris theory, an atheist manifesto. Shaw's atheistic perspectives are used to disable all the religions, waving the flag of atheism in the air. He claims through his characters in the story that clumsy hands are only the cause of all sufferings and miseries as it has been explained in Harris' theory regarding God. Muslim God is amateur that is why he implements limitations over his creature because he himself is not satisfied what he is created. George Bernard Shaw, with help of his characters, tries to promote the atheist notion throughout the world, rejecting all religions because he thinks that institutionalized religions are the cause of violence and destruction.

All the power is God's. I have no authority over anyone; nor even has the devil. I warn you and he attempts you. But if you want to see the sign of God, then look around you. Don't you see them in creation of heavens and earth; in the change of day and night, and in the water when it revives the dry

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

earth and gives it life after death, and brings forth the new green? In the movements of winds and the clouds; in the rising of sun and waxing of the moon? Are there no signs in these? (Kazi, 1933, p. 57)

When Brown girl, protagonist character in Kazi's story, meets Messenger, she asks him to suggest the signs through which she can accept the existence of God, because in the outset of story Kazi has introduced her as an atheist who raises the questions regarding the existence of God. Messenger replies the lady in a mannerable way as he can logically and rationally solve the problem and persuades her to believe in the existence of God. He displays the omnipotence of Allah at every corner of world and his control over all creation that exist in heaven and earth. The discourse, in above statement, regarding the concept of Allah is produced under the light of Islamic theory. Kazi through characters in the story tries to encounter atheistic approach of Shaw which he has conveyed with support of characters in his story, the Adventures of Black Girl in

Her Search for God. The Messenger tells Brown girl that the sun rises and sets in at its due time without changing its direction. The clouds float on the sky without having feathers that process is only in the hand of the creator such types of attributes are not related to human nature. Man developed his mind slowly and gradually and discovered number of things by aping

God but remained unable to bestow them an eternal life. For instance; with the help of the scientific temperament humans introduced a robot but they failed to provide it a human mind and thinking abilities. In the same way, whatever humans have created it occupies limited functions and life. It refers to the certain limitations of human nature and power. She is impressed by Islamic ideology and converts from atheism to theism. Thus, the atheistic approach of Shaw which is developed in his story is rationally encountered by the character of Messenger in the story of Kazi with the reference of Islamic theory.

"He would hardly keep us alive for the pleasure of looking at us, ugly and ephemeral insects as we are. Therefore come in and help to cultivate this garden to His glory. The rest you had better leave to Him." (Kazi, 1933, p. 68)

Black Girl, at the end of her journey, meets an Old Gentle man, who performs major to change the views of Black Girl regarding the Concept of God, and he presents the picture of God as amateur. Old man is considered as gentle man in Shaw's story, because he supports to atheistic approach. Thus, he influences the mind of Black Girl and leads her to the way of atheism where she spends her life, rejecting the identity of God. Old man says that God sends human beings to achieve his work and kills them after gaining His purposes. It proves that the ideas of Old man, in the story of G.B Shaw, support to atheistic approach, avoiding the

identity of God.

The character of Black Girl reaches on dismal conclusion and accepts the notion of atheism that proves her an atheist character in the story of George Bernard Shaw, *The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God*. She finally claims that human beings gain their purposes of without guidance of God, so they are Gods in their lives. Thus, she considers herself as demi-god in the story. She lives her entire life, following atheism. However, the character of Old man, in the story, is a clear depiction of atheist who supports to atheistic approach, denying the identity of God as it is mentioned in cited lines.

"Realization my child, Realization, which means obtaining nearer and nearer, profounder and profounder glimpses of God till He is seen in full glory." (Kazi, 1933, p. 124) These words have been uttered by History, a character of I.I. Kazi's story. He suggests Brown Girl that realization is the best way to understand the concept of God. The existence of God can be realized by analyzing nature with keen observation that, how it works without any controller. The force behind the control of all such things clearly symbolizes the omnipresence and existence of God as it is mentioned in theoretical framework. He also suggests her that realization, in the life of human beings, is the best way to understand full glory of God. The process of realization helps to remove veils that exist between humans and God, and it also helps to know the

concept of God and His identity.

Brown Girl inspires from the ideas of history and turns to theism. After a long journey of her life, she understands the purpose of life in world and becomes sympathetic lady towards all humans. So, she offers lunch to beggar and her daughter and she provides cake and some other dishes in front of them. The daughter of beggar tries to eat all the things quickly as possible as she can, and her mother, who pretends to see through one eye, losses her control of one eye and she suddenly opens her other eye. Brown Girl shocks and learns from that omen to understand the concept of God, who exists behind many veils. Thus, the belief of Brown Girl regarding the concept of God becomes stronger than ever.

Conclusions

The last segment is based on findings of the current research, Allama I.I.Kazi, with the help of Islamic theory, removes allegations that has been raised to demoralize the concept of God by Shaw in his story. Kazi deconstructs the atheistic notion of Shaw by representing the love of God to human in his story. He claims that God bestows brain to human beings as they can justify the evil and good and punish evils. It is mind which helps human being to understand the signs of god, but they cannot understand signs of God, because they are busy in their materialistic desires and it is a flaw of human, not god.

*The Question of the Creator: Juxtaposition of Contrastive
Literary Rhetoric in Allama I.I. Kazi's and
G. B. Shaw's Fictional Works*

This current research is carried out with reference of Islamic theory to promote the theistic notion throughout the world, and stand as resistance in the way of atheism. This also clarifies facts regarding the concept of God who is eternal, God sends his prophets to develop human mind and guide them in the earth. This also clarifies that he tries to provide a safe shelter for institutionalized religion.

Brown Girl converts from atheism to theism, she is inspired from the ideology of Muslim that God exists behind many veils and one can only understand his presence when he knows the purpose of his existence in the world. The research helps to prove that Kazi counters the atheistic approach of Shaw, bringing Brown girl back to theism. The research also clarifies that God possesses power over all creatures, but he does not use His power to treat His creature as minute insect. Thus, the atheistic perspectives of George Bernard Shaw are encountered through the story of Kazi. Shaw says that God uses his power to suppress the freewill of human beings, and He threatens his creature to worship Him and wishes to possess high glory in the universe. The arguments of Kazi against Shaw's views are analyzed with reference of Islamic theory, theistic approach, through Brown girl and other characters of the story, has revealed in this research; all luxuries of universe belong to God, and the researcher has evaluated data with reference of Islamic theory that there is no compulsion in religion unless one prays with his all hearts and soul. So, the

researcher clarifies through his findings that those people who offer prayer in the fear of God; the prayer is of no use and is disrespect to God. The research has limitations which rely on G.B Shaw and Allama I.I Kazi's mentioned works; The Adventures of Brown Girl in Her Search for God and The Adventures of Black Girl in Her Search for God.

References

- Allama I.I. Kazi - A few glimpses from his life | ALL THINGS PAKISTAN. (2009, August 13). Retrieved from <https://pakistaniat.com/2007/07/23/allama-iikazi-a-few-glimpses-from-his-life/>
- Bainbrige, W. S. (2009). The Oxford Handbook of the Sociology of Religion. Oxford University Press.
- Concept of God in Islam. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.islam101.com/tauhheed/conceptofGod.htm>
- Drange, T. M. (1998). Science and Miracles. Retrieved from https://infidels.org/library/modern/theodore_drange/miracles.html
- Greksa, C. E. (2015). The atheist experience: a sociological approach to atheist identity in college students. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database.

Harris, S. (2017, December 4). An Atheist Manifesto | Sam Harris. Retrieved from <https://samharris.org/an-atheist-manifesto/>

Jay Wegter, M.Div. (2009). Theism versus Atheism "Debate" (Doctoral dissertation).Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database.

Jowers, D. W. (2015). Open theism: its nature, history and limitations (Unpublished doctoral dissertation).

Kazi, I. I. (1933). Adventures of the Brown Girl in Her Search for God. England: Arthur H. Stockwell Limited.

Karim, Fathema, Hakim. (2015). Doctor Faustus: theist or Atheist or Atheist (Unpublished master's thesis). International Islamic University, Chittagong, Bangladesh.

Oliphint, K. S. (2012). (The Son of God)God with Us. In God with us: Divine Condescension and the Attributes of God. Wheaton, IL: Crossway.

Shariati, A. (2010). Religion vs. Religion, trans. Laleh Bakhtiar.

Shaw, B. (1932). The adventures of the black girl in her search for god (1st ed.). Landon Constable and Company limited.

Incestuous Overtones in Mehreen Jabbar and Bano Qudsia's Laal Baig

¹Muhammad Ali

¹M.Phil Scholar, Government College University, Lahore

Abstract

This paper argues that the Pakistani telefilm Laal Baig carries incestuous overtones. Written by Bano Qudsia and directed by Mehreen Jabbar in 1999, Laal Baig is based on a conflict between a mother and her daughter-in-law. However, if it is critically revisited from a psychoanalytical perspective, it is realized that the distancing between the husband and wife stems from an incestuous relationship between the mother and the son. The specific terms extracted from the psychoanalytical theory include Oedipal Complex coined by Sigmund Freud and Jocasta Complex coined by Raymond de Saussure, considering that inclinations from both the mother and the son manifest themselves in the dramatic production under scrutiny. The telefilm's authentic file uploaded by the director herself on YouTube has been retrieved for analysis, while a 'reading between the lines' methodology has been applied on the dialogues of Laal Baig to procure the underlying ideas of the story and find answers to the following questions: What are the hidden reasons behind Begum Siddiqui's hatred for her daughter-in-law? Does this hatred find its roots in a tabooed feeling? If this is the case, then which dialogues from the telefilm insinuate an incestuous relation between Begum Siddiqui and Zafar? The study draws to a conclusion with the idea that Laal Baig provides a psychological justification for the common issue of Pakistan's married couples, that of an unfriendly relation between mothers and daughters-in-law.

Keywords: Incest, Jocasta Complex, Oedipal Complex

Author's Email: m.ali_aquarius85@yahoo.com

Introduction

This paper critically analyses the Pakistani telefilm, Laal Baig, arguing that the dramatic production from 1999 is infused with incestuous overtones. Written by Bano Qudsia and directed by Mehreen Jabbar, Laal Baig is based on the household issue of Pakistan, that of a mother and daughter-in-law's tussle over a married man.

However, Laal Baig attempts delving deeper into the matter and finding out the psychological justifications of the characters' attitudes, resulting in the mother and son's inclination towards each other coming out as sexual.

The theoretical framework that has been opted for validating this argument is Psychoanalysis, the specific terms being Oedipus Complex

coined by Sigmund Freud and Jocasta Complex coined by Raymond de Saussure. Along-with, analyses on the appearance of cockroaches and dogs in dreams have also been consulted to have a better understanding of the symbols employed in the telefilm.

A review of the literature written on Bano Qudsia's work tells that the researches carried out on the writer's craft have mostly dealt with her fiction, that too being *Raja Gidh* in a majority of the cases. Farah Deeba and Dr Ahmed Usman, in their paper titled "Rediscovering the Discourse on Women's Freedom: A Feminist Exploration of Bano Qudsia's Fiction", take *Raja Gidh* as the primary work and study Bano Qudsia's take on modern and independent women. Hammad Farooq also focuses on the same novel in his paper, "The Infinite Curiosity: Exploring Romantic Tendencies in *Raja Gidh*" and argues that the novel has tropes of English Romanticism in it and it would not be unjust to call it a Romanticist piece of fiction. Muhammad Rizwan and Sumaira Akhtar move towards a different domain and study *Raja Gidh* from a linguistic point of view, focusing on the intermingling of English and Urdu languages in the novel through their paper, "An English-Urdu Code-mixing Textual Analysis of Bano Qudsia's Novel *Raja Gidh*". The research gap which this paper attempts to fill is the one created owing to a negligent attitude towards Bano Qudsia's dramatic work, and that too written for television.

The study employs a 'reading

between the lines' methodology on the telefilm's dialogues to have a thorough understanding of the story's underlying ideas. Considering that *Laal Baig* is an Urdu language work and that from the distant past, its file available on YouTube has been retrieved for researching while the dialogues have been transcribed into English language using indirect speech.

Through this study, an attempt has been made at finding answers to the following questions: What are the reasons behind Begum Siddiqui's hatred for her daughter-in-law? Does this hatred find its roots in a tabooed feeling? If this is the case, which dialogues from the telefilm insinuate an incestuous relation between Begum Siddiqui and Zafar?

Analysis

Laal Baig opens with a scene of Begum Siddiqui, a middle-aged woman, sitting in a psychiatrist's clinic, giving out nervous gestures and asking questions reflecting bafflement.

The idea that *Laal Baig* deals with the repressed desires of a human being validates itself with the psychiatrist's statement given while trying to make Begum Siddique probe into her unconscious. He says that a person's mind is but a pond, on the surface of which a few water-lilies coupled with fresh, green leaves keep floating, but what matters is the dry stuff which water carries in its depths. When the underlying withered and lifeless leaves reach the surface, a lot of

complications are solved. (Jabbar, 2011, 10:52)

This seems to be a very subtle and a careful reinforcement of the idea that "the desires that can't be fulfilled are packed, or repressed, into a particular place in the mind, which Freud labels the unconscious." (Klages, 1997, para. 4) Bano Qudsia keeps it symbolic and instead of directly saying that the repressed desires like incest, murder and cannibalism, considered to be the three snubbed wishes of every human being, come to the front when the unconscious part of the brain is shaken, makes use of metaphorical language and names the surface parts of the brain as water and the hidden desires as lifeless leaves which are not at work until consciously brought into action to see what keeps the human being disturbed.

This subtlety and symbolism pervade throughout *Laal Baig* because Begum Siddiqui, in the very start of the film, confesses that she hates the light (1:36), indirectly referring to the fact that it is with the dark layers of the human mind that her wishes are connected, and she is afraid that light or clarity might disclose her incestuous inclination towards her son. A few minutes later, when she does make an effort to recall her first day of restlessness, the first thing that comes into her mind is the day when her son, Zafar, brought his newly-wed wife, Amal to Karachi. Here, the director, Mehreen Jabbar inserts a flashback scene in which Zafar and Amal are entering their house and Begum

Siddiqui is alighting from the stairs. She is shown hugging her son, smiling at him and patting him on the cheek while turning her face towards the other side at the sight of her daughter-in-law. (6:31)

That Begum Siddiqui's hatred is based on jealousy and not on the typical idea that her daughter-in-law is not good at household work, as is usually the case in clashes between mothers and daughters-in-law, proves itself when after recalling this day, Begum Siddiqui asks her psychiatrist the meaning of envy. (7:16) After attaining the answer that it has got to do with an inferiority complex, Begum Siddiqui makes another confession. She says to the psychiatrist that it was like an envelope that her daughter-in-law wrapped herself around her Zafar. (7:57) This statement carries multiple important ideas. That Begum Siddiqui refers to Zafar as "her Zafar" conveys her unhealthy attachment towards her son as a result of which she exercises a certain control over him, and the simile of an envelope which she uses for her daughter-in-law tells that she is jealous of the time and attention which initially was hers but later on started being invested into the wife. Her disturbed sleep and the dream of the barbed wire and the dog also make their way into her life only after her son's marriage.

The dream which Begum Siddiqui describes to her psychiatrist is of a barbed wire that makes itself visible before her eyes. In the same dream, after the barbed wire, it is a dog that appears and barks before a tree,

pinning for it but not able to reach it. While it is easy to comprehend that a barbed wire symbolizes separation, and in the context of *Laal Baig*, the distancing of Begum Siddiqui from her son, it becomes important to see what dogs mean in dreams to understand the hidden idea behind the woman's dream. While dreams themselves are "concealed realizations of repressed desires" (Freud, 1921, para. 5), dogs in dreams are said to represent "a part of yourself kept hidden from others", and an angry, barking dog, as in Begum Siddiqui's dream, can mean that someone is "grouchy, irritated or unhappy". Also, a "dog in a dream might also be a "stand-in" for a friend or family member you want to protect". (Williams, 2017, para. 4)

All of these interpretations combined, hold true for the condition of Begum Siddiqui who is hiding a dark side of her personality, that of her too close an association with her son, who is unhappy at the arrival of Amal, and who wants to keep her son away from the young girl. This dream can also be interpreted in another way. The dog in yearning can be taken as Begum Siddiqui herself. If the tree is taken as a symbol of life, then for Begum Siddiqui, the life-giving tree can be her son with whom she has spent a major part of her life and from whom she has taken all of her life energy, but she is being stopped from going too close to him by the use of a collar in the neck, which symbolizes socio-cultural customs as hindrances between a mother and son's incestuous relationship.

The next scene in the film is the most important one, for creatively yet directly, it hints multiple times at the complex from which Begum Siddiqui suffers. This is the scene in which she remembers a bedroom conversation between her son and daughter-in-law, which to the disgust of the viewers, is both observed and intervened into by Begum Siddiqui. Here, it also becomes essential to see how the director has formulated the scene. The camera zooms the bed of the husband and wife and it is with the huge bed in the centre and Amal and Zafar walking around it instead of sitting or lying on it that their conversation is taking place, and Begum Siddiqui is standing in the door listening to them. (12:30)

This act on Begum Siddiqui's part is an explicit example of her jealousy with the intimacy between Zafar and Amal, as a result of which she has gone to the extent of observing what is happening in their bedroom. And what is happening in their bedroom is again important because it is based on a row between the husband and wife in which Amal repeatedly says to Zafar that he has not grown adolescent yet.

Through this statement of hers, it is told to the viewers that Amal and Zafar have not consummated their relationship, otherwise Amal would not have reiterated the statement that her husband is not an adolescent, but is still tied to the womb of her mother. This conveys the idea that Zafar has not been able to move out of the age in which a boy becomes "unconsciously sexually

attached to his mother" (McLeod, 2018, para. 4), as a result of which he fails to have intercourse with his wife because the idea of his mother as the fulfiller of his sexual desires has been incorporated strongly into him. It is due to these infantile desires not having resolved themselves that Zafar is still an adolescent who cannot make it out with a young girl.

At this point, Begum Siddiqui also comes forward with a surprisingly bolder manifestation of her carnal desire for her son when she says that only two women are associated with a man, one from whose body he comes into being, and the other who comes into the world from his being; in essence, his mother and his daughter (13:47). By saying this, Begum Siddiqui tries to convey the idea that the women who matter the most for a man are those who are physically associated with him, and at the basis of whose connection with him lies a sexual activity. Later on, Begum Siddiqui goes on to say that since a man is closer to only his mother and his daughter, she wishes that Zafar may never have a daughter (15: 13). She does not say anything after this but makes it clear that it is not only a wife which she does not want in her son's life, but the presence of a daughter as well will disturb her, which suggests that there is the only woman which she wants in her son's life, and that is she herself.

When she tries to justify herself, she unconsciously states the causes which in Psychology, are considered to be the causes of Jocasta

Complex, the sexual inclination of a mother towards her son. What Begum Siddiqui says is that she got widowed at the age of eighteen and spent the rest of her life with her son (16:54). About Jocasta Complex, it is said that the phenomenon is "something perhaps particularly relevant with an intelligent son and an absent/weak father figure" ("Jocasta Complex", 2014).

This cause holds true in the case of Begum Siddiqui who when tells that her husband passed away when she was just eighteen years old, is lamenting at the wasting away of her young age in which she was extremely beautiful. Probably as a result of this loss, she invested all her love and energy in her son, the only man left in her life after the death of her husband.

However, even after having made these cathartic statements, Begum Siddiqui's hatred towards her daughter-in-law does not abate and she does not allow her son to leave the house along-with Amal. Later on, the viewers are told that before the two women were able to resolve their conflict, Zafar passed away and Begum Siddiqui started hallucinating cockroaches on her bed as well as on her son's funeral pyre.

At this point, Begum Siddiqui also starts accusing her daughter-in-law of being a cockroach and says to her that she is the insect which comes out at night and crawls (28:07).

This statement by Begum Siddiqui conveys the idea that by

considering her daughter-in-law a cockroach which comes out at night only, she is referring towards her jealousy at Amal becoming a part of her son's nights, or to put it more directly, at Amal becoming her son's sexual partner with whom he is to share the bed after marriage.

Psychoanalytically, "Freudian analysts like Camille Paglia have seen the cockroach as symbol not just of the underside but also of the dark and sexual powers of the id" (Copeland, 2003, p.114).

This psychoanalysis helps us in understanding three important scenes from the telefilm, one based on cockroaches lying on Begum Siddiqui's bed, one based on the accusation that Amal is a cockroach, and one of her fear of cockroaches.

When Begum Siddiqui is asked by the psychiatrist regarding her first experience of envisioning cockroaches, she recalls the day of her son's death and his pyre lying before her eyes, covered with cockroaches, followed by another hallucination, that of cockroaches crawling on her bed. If Paglia's analysis about cockroaches being a symbol of one's hidden sexual inclinations is brought under consideration, then Begum Siddiqui's cockroach hallucinations after her son's death would suggest that it is after losing her son that she has realized what kept her connected with him, something beyond the simple mother-son relation. It was in her unconscious when Zafar was alive that she is

incestuously involved in him, and it is after his death that her hidden desire has surfaced and brought pain. The idea proves itself as somewhat correct when we see that even Begum Siddiqui's bed is covered in cockroaches. A sex symbol is imagined on the bed is a manifestation of the idea that what the mother is missing at this point is a sharing of bed with her son, but something which she does not wish to express or believe herself, considering that the cockroaches make her scared. This fear of cockroaches also makes itself visible in the psychiatrist's clinic when the woman starts imagining the cockroaches on her clothes and tries to make them go away. Her gesture of cleaning herself of the cockroaches also suggests that although she knows what is going on in her mind, she is not ready to accept it because of the society and is therefore trying to cleanse herself of the taboo of incest. Moreover, Begum Siddiqui's statement that her daughter-in-law is not a human being but a cockroach carries the idea that for Begum Siddiqui, the wife is the cockroach because it was with confidence and without any reservations that Amal entered Zafar's life as someone who could actively have a sexual experience with him, something which Begum Siddiqui herself wanted to do.

The audience is also made to know here that although Amal did enter Zafar's life as a sexual partner, she could not induce him to make love, for he was too filled with the idea of his mother as his only lover. Multiple dialogues by Amal come forward as

shreds of evidence of Zafar's sexual activity with a young girl being something that has been snubbed, overpowered by the love of his mother, or he is afraid to have intercourse with his wife in fear of giving birth to a daughter who would share the physical connection he has with his mother. After Zafar's funeral, Amal is found saying to her mother-in-law that she tried a lot to breathe life into Zafar's living dead body through her hot breaths, but failed because Zafar's mother had snatched away the desire of life from her son (27:40). If rewritten in a non-creative manner, this statement would mean nothing else but that Amal tried to incline Zafar to make love with her through her burning sexual desire, but he refused to give a chance to another woman.

Thus Amal's concern that her husband needs to move out of Begum Siddiqui's house to give his wife a healthy love comes as justified, for it is while envisioning a future of the husband and wife together that Amal says that she will rob Zafar of everything that he has hidden, and in return, nature will make him adolescent (19:08). By this, she means that it is when Zafar will be separated from his mother that he will be able to openly make use of his sexual organs before his wife and will be finally rendered adolescent.

However, to the misfortune of both the women, Zafar passes away, surprisingly leaving both the women not as haters but transforming them into caretakers of each other. The

abnormality which Begum Siddiqui faces after losing her son is treated by a psychiatrist the sessions with whom are organized by Amal herself. It is both interesting and surprising to see that the two women who were at a war with each other when Zafar was alive befriend one another after his death. It is not only Begum Siddiqui who says to the psychiatrist that her daughter-in-law cares for her a lot, but Amal herself also says that Begum Siddiqui is the only tangible memory that she has of Zafar. Amal's statement provides a profound understanding of the confusion regarding both the women's sudden liking for each other. It tells that both of the women were madly in love with Zafar, so much so that they did not allow anyone else to enter his life but themselves kept revolving around him. And when he finally left or walked away from between the two women, they had no one to look for support but each other. The domestic issue was so much intense that the only memories the women could find of Zafar had to be from inside the house, and since there was nothing but two humans as quarrelling objects acting as the only memory of Zafar, they held on to each other.

It also needs to be discussed why Begum Siddiqui turns paranoid after her son's death and Amal manages to control her nerves. This subtly points at the intensity of emotions which Zafar provided to both the women. Amal's dialogues stated above have already told us that Amal and Zafar were never able to consummate their relationship, and therefore Amal failed at having her

physical desires fulfilled through Zafar. It might be one of the reasons why Amal does not lose senses at her husband's death because their relationship was never complete or rich enough. However, Begum Siddiqui's madness suggests that the relationship between the mother and son was so strong that Begum Siddiqui not only loses her mind but also starts seeing insects which symbolize sexual activity. This tells that the woman who had a physical connection with her son from a very young age goes mad while the one who kept her love spiritual managed to remain calm. That the mother's relation was a lustful one and the wife's relation a spiritual one is proved by Amal's dialogue in which she says that she married Zafar with the desire of seeping into his soul (14:40) and can rid herself of the desire of his body if she wishes to (14:48), countered by the mother's wish that Zafar may not give birth to a daughter lest he may develop a physical connection with another woman.

The fact that Begum Siddiqui kept hiding her carnal desire for her son from Amal is proven when in the last scene of the film, she asks her psychiatrist not to tell Amal what she has told him. Although the viewers are not told what it is which she has directly told the psychiatrist, from the flashback scenes and the dialogues, what is deduced is that Begum Siddiqui finally confessed that she was in love in an unusual way with her son. This deduction is also made based on the initial statement of the psychiatrist in which he asks Begum Siddiqui to revisit her unconscious and probe into her repressed desires so that her

conflicts may be resolved. Her convalescence along-with a fear that she might be exposed connect all the strings in a meaningful way and tell that she has succeeded in coming face to face with her suppressed inclinations.

Conclusions

A critical analysis of *Laal Baig* not only provides us with a psychological justification of a common issue of our country, that of conflicts between mothers and daughters-in-law but also makes us realize that Pakistani television drama has moved from a subtle and creative treatment of subjects to a superficial one. *Laal Baig* addresses an issue which is there in every Pakistani television drama, but the nuances of the relationships in a household are not dealt with, nor are the psyches of the characters probed into as is done with *Begum Siddiqui*.

Through this research, an effort has been made to bring a such a Pakistani telefilm to the front which owing to its creativity and underlying deep ideas falls perfectly into a complex theoretical framework and to propagate the idea that a dramatic production does not have to stretch itself over twenty episodes, but a thirty-minute long piece can tend to establish itself as a literary work with its bold but carefully crafted dialogues.

The social relevance of this study is comprehensible through the unfortunate fact that even after more than two decades of the telefilm's

release, episodes based on this issue keep raising their heads in the Pakistani society time and again, making us realize that we still need to delve deep into the matter and see where the root of the problem lies, something which Bano Qudsia and Mehreen Jabbar attempted to do back in the 1990s.

However, the limitation of this research lies in the lack of an in-depth analysis of the visual techniques employed by the director. Since the objective of the research was targeted at the written content and not at the directorial art, the telefilm's colour symbols, music and settings incorporating minimal props have not been earnestly looked into, although they complement the theme of the telefilm quite well and render the duo of Mehreen Jabbar and Bano Qudsia a commendable one.

References

- Copeland. M. (2003). Cockroach. Reaktion Books Ltd.
- Deeba, Farah & Usman, Dr Ahmed, (2019). "Rediscovering the Discourse on Women's Freedom: A Feminist Exploration of Bano Qudsia's Fiction". *Journal of Political Studies*, 26(2), 137-147
- Freud, Sigmund (1921). *Dream Psychology: Psychoanalysis for Beginners* [Online Version]. Retrieved from bartleby.com/288/3.html
- Hammad, Mustaq, (2012). "The Infinite Curiosity-Exploring Romantic Tendencies in Raja Gidh". *Language of India*, (12), 385-389
- Jabbar, Mehreen. [Mehreen Jabbar]. (2011, August 29). Laal Baig [Video]. YouTube. youtube.com/watch?v=o4W8AXb-YPy&t=886s
- Jocasta Complex. (2014, February 23). Retrieved from artandpopularculture.com/Jocasta-complex
- Klages, Dr. Mary (1997 n.d.). *Psychoanalysis and Sigmund Freud*. Retrieved from webpages.uidaho.edu/~sflores/KlagesFreud.html/
- McLeod, Saul (2018 n.d.). "Oedipal Complex". Simple Psychology. Retrieved from simplypsychology.org/oedipal-complex.html
- Rizwan, Muhammad & Akhtar, Sumaira, (2015). "An English-Urdu Code-mixing Textual Analysis of Bano Qudsia's Novel Raja Gidh". *European Academic Research*, 2(10), 13505-13525
- Williams, Julia (2017, October 5). What Do Dreams about Dogs Mean? Retrieved from canidae.com/blog/2017/10/what-do-dreams-about-dogs-mean/

Investigating the Accuracy of Google Translate in Translating Urdu Linguistic Elements

Zafar Ullah¹,
Fakiha Iqbal Shah²

¹Department of English, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad

²Department of English, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad

Abstract

This study aims to investigate the accuracy of Google Translate regarding the translation of idioms and proverbs from and to English language. The shortcomings of Google Translate and the limitations of Neural Machine Translation have also been pointed out after in-depth analysis of carefully chosen examples from authentic lexicons. An experiment has been conducted by running Urdu and English idioms, proverbs and other linguistic expressions through Google Translate. The theoretical framework of Antoine Berman's twelve deforming tendencies has been employed to analyse these examples and Mixed Methods design has been applied for the evaluation in the study. The error analysis highlighted all the linguistic mistakes and errors committed by the software during Google machine translation. Major contribution of this study is the provision of the accurate alternatives for the wrong translation. This study plays a diagnostic role in identifying and classifying those errors. Furthermore, it contributes in improving the quality of Machine Translation from Urdu to English and English to Urdu. In the end, suggestions for the effective advancements in the software have also been provided.

Keywords: Google Neural Machine Translation (GNMT), Google Translate, Machine Translation (MT), Neural Machine Translation (NMT), Translation Errors.

Author's E-mail: fakiha.iqbal.96@gmail.com

Introduction

Translation is the process of communicating the meaning of a text from one language to another, hence, it requires great effort, precision and care so the exact meaning should be transferred without any omission, expansion or destruction. There are around 6,500 languages spoken and written all around the world. During contemporary era, the world has

transformed into a global village, translation has become one of the major means of international communication. Therefore, there is a dire need for automating the translation process and making it as accurate as possible. This research sheds light on the errors committed by translation software, specifically Google Translate, while translating certain linguistic elements from English to Urdu and Urdu to English.

Warren Weaver (1894-1978) is considered as the pioneer of machine translation due to his "Memorandum on Translation" written in 1947 (Hutchins, 1997). In the memorandum, he presented the idea of the field of machine translation. Practical efforts were initiated by Yehosha Bar-Hillel in 1951. Throughout the last half of the 20th century, MT progressed at a fast pace and by 1997, SYSTRAN was giving free translation services for short texts online. Consequently, in 2009, Google introduced Google Translate, its complimentary translation service. Google Translate was initially based on Statistical Machine Translation (SMT) which translated the text into English first, and then into the target language. It had poor accuracy and made several errors. Therefore, in 2016, Google switched to Neural Machine Translation (NMT) which involved deep learning and produced more accurate results. The end-to-end learning approach helped translate text from the source language directly to the target language after analysing millions of text samples. Due to this advancement, Google Translate now reportedly translates over 100 billion words a day, as of 2018.

Google has made it easier for its users to access this service by launching its application in 2011. It offers translational services in over 100 languages for free. It can also translate webpages, texts in pictures and handwritten text. In 2012, Google announced that around 200 million people use Google Translate every month for translating different kinds of

text. Now, over 200 million people use it daily. Therefore, improving its accuracy will benefit millions of users. Google also has its own Google Translate Community which encourages users to improve the accuracy of Google Translate by providing the most accurate translations of texts provided by Google itself. The process is not very effective as it is slow and allows users to only contribute for the words or phrases it asks for itself.

This study raises the following research question of where and how does Google Translate fail to translate commonly used Urdu proverbs, idioms and other linguistic structures from English to Urdu language and vice versa? To answer this question, certain proverbs and idioms have been translated to and from Urdu and, the results have been analysed qualitatively. These linguistic elements have been taken individually, without providing any context to the software, as the focus of this research is limited to common Urdu and English expressions. This has not only lead to the discovery of common errors committed by Google Translate but has also pointed out the shortcomings of the neural machine translation. As the field of machine translation is still young, finding such flaws will pave way for improvements and advancements. Such changes have the power to positively impact millions of people and make translation easier.

Literature Review

Arturo Trujillo (Trujillo, 1999) stated the history of Machine Translation in a succinct manner. The initial efforts to translate texts with the help of machines had been started in 1947 since the early use of computers for deciphering codes during World Wars. The first Russian-English prototype for Machine translation was developed in 1954 based on strategies proposed by Warren Weaver. This laid the foundation of machine translation of natural languages in the United States and around the world. During 1960s, machine translation faced a setback in government funding when it was proposed that Machine Translation was not cost effective. The funds were directed towards Artificial Intelligence and a few Machine Translation groups survived in the USA, with most of the research being done abroad. However, during the 1970s, SYSTRAN was advanced to the level where it was taken up to be used by US Air Force and the Commission of the European Union. By the 90s, the field had seen so much progress that it was being used around the world to translate academic and professional texts on personal computers. and in software, multimedia, personal computers and Shifting from SYSTRAN gradually to Statistical Machine Translation proved to be revolutionary for translational purposes. The Statistical Machine Translation (SMT) systems translate texts based on statistical models of bilingual corpora (Trujillo, 1999). In 2013, Aasim Ali, Arshad Hussain and Muhammad Kamran Malik studied the

Model for English-Urdu Statistical Machine Translation (Aasim Ali, 2013). Their study was based on the issues regarding corpus alignment as no parallel aligned data were available for these languages. They found that, due to Statistical Machine Translation's complete reliance on aligned data, words with low or none corresponding occurrences were not translated into the target language.

In 2014, a study was conducted regarding English to Urdu Statistical Machine Translation: Establishing a Baseline (Bushra Jawaid, 2014). The research compared baseline Phrase Based Machine Translation (PBMT) with Hierarchical Machine Translation and found the latter to be more accurate for Urdu-English translations.

In 2016, Google switched from Statistical Machine Translation (SMT) to Neural Machine Translation (NMT) (Yonghui Wu, 2016). It claimed that due to its end-to-end learning approach, it was more accurate than SMT. They called it Google Neural Machine Translation (GNMT) and concluded that due to its accuracy and speed, GNMT could translate huge amounts of data in high quality.

Several researches regarding Neural Machine Translation followed and worked on finding the limitations of NMT. A research, in 2017, regarding Fully Character-Level Neural Machine Translation without Explicit Segmentation concluded that using fully character-level NMT helped translate words without explicit

segmentation and the model learnt these concepts from the act of translation itself (Jason Lee, 2017). This model was suitable for languages with rich morphology and vocabulary such as Urdu.

Very little work had been done regarding Urdu-English machine translation with the help of Google Translate. A couple of notable researches included a study of Urdu to English Machine Translation using Bilingual Evaluation Understudy (Asad Abdul Malik, 2013). It focused on the accuracy of SMT in comparison to EBMT and concluded that EBMT proved to be more accurate when translating Urdu to English.

Another important contribution was made in 2014 when Sharmin Muzaffar, Pitambar Behera brought out the issues pertaining to the plural markers of the Urdu verbs based on data generated through Bing and Google translators. With a view to capture the verbal inflections, the data for experimentation purpose was collected from natural language for simple forms of all tenses (Muzaffar & Behera, 2014). Typical Urdu last words for 12 tenses (TA HE, TE HE, TA HEY for Simple Present Tense) must be added for correct translation or detecting the right tense in Urdu.

All the aforementioned studies contributed in the field of Machine Translation but none of them dealt with the Urdu-English translation by NMT or GNMT. Moreover, this study focused on the translation of selected

idioms, proverbs and other commonly used linguistic expressions in both English and Urdu languages. Therefore, this study is unique and original as compared to all the previous studies.

Research Methodology

The purpose of this research was to test the accuracy and realism in the translation by Google Translate's neural machine system. For this purpose, we used an inductive approach and induced results from the selected examples. Moreover, mixed methods were used for this research as it allowed the use of both qualitative and quantitative data. Mixed methods also made the research more accurate as the use of mixed methodologies and cross-checking is possible. The main objective of this research was to find the shortcomings of Google Translate so its creators can improve its Urdu-English translation according to authentic lexicons like Oxford Urdu English Dictionary and Farhang-e-Aasifiya.

The data used in this exploratory research had been taken from different sources for cross-validation with the help of simple random sampling. The sources of the data are authentic publications by the Oxford University Press. The total corpus consists of sixty items from which ten English idioms were taken from Seidl & McMordie (1988) and ten Urdu idioms were taken from Phillott (1912). For English proverbs, Speake (2008) was taken as source and ten proverbs were taken from here.

Furthermore, ten Urdu proverbs were taken from 'Famous Urdu Proverbs Translated into English' (2014). Moreover, other lexical elements including grammatical gender and relations were also translated. The first section focuses on the results generated by translation of English text to Urdu and conversely, the second section focuses on Outcomes obtained by translating Urdu text to English.

The translation of these idioms, proverbs and other lexical expressions were then analysed on the basis of the Theoretical Framework of Antonio Berman's twelve deforming tendencies (Berman, 2000). These tendencies, according to Berman, were innate in translation and were, therefore, unavoidable. These twelve tendencies include rationalisation, clarification,

expansion, ennoblement or popularisation, qualitative impoverishment, quantitative impoverishment, the destruction of rhythms, the destruction of underlying networks of signification, the destruction of linguistic patterning, the destruction of vernacular network or their exoticisation, the destruction of expressions and idioms, the effacement of the superimposition of languages. The study finds out which tendencies are more dominant than others in translation by Google Translate.

Results and Discussion

Following are ten English idioms that have been taken from Seidl & McMordie (J. Seidl, 1988) and translated through the Google Neural Machine Translation software:

Table English Idioms

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
1	Bad blood	گندا خون
2	To be in someone's bad books	کسی کی بری کتابوں میں شامل ہونا۔
3	To be hard on someone	کسی پر سختی کرنا۔
4	Through thick and thin	موٹی اور پتلی کے ذریعے۔
5	A thin excuse	ایک باریک عذر۔
6	First things first	ضروری کام پہلے
7	Small world	چھوٹی دنیا
8	Once and for all	ایک بار اور سب کے لئے
9	There and then	وہاں اور پھر۔
10	A breath of fresh air	تازہ ہوا کا ایک سانس۔

In the very first example, Google Translate has translated the idiom literally, word to word. Moreover, the translation 'bad blood' has a completely different connotation in Urdu than the meaning of 'bad blood' and is a separate term. Therefore, the original meaning of the idiom is lost in translation. Similarly, in the second example, the translator has carried out literal translation of the idiom and hence, loses its original meaning. In the third example, it carries out correct translation of the idiom. In the fourth example, it again carries out literal translation and uses feminine terms for describing 'thick and thin'. This choice of grammatical gender exhibits destruction of the vernacular network. The same problem is with the fifth example, although, here it uses the word 'thick' for 'thin' which is totally inaccurate. This adjective cannot be used with the word 'thin'. Therefore, it not only fails to convey the correct meaning of the idiom, but it also ends up constructing an expression without any proper meaning. Similarly, in the eighth and ninth example, it again carries out literal translation destroying

the meaning of the idiom completely, however, it does accurate translation of the sixth, seventh and tenth example.

The main problem with GNMT is its inability to convey the connotative meaning of the idioms. It keeps on producing results with denotative meanings, by carrying out word to word translations. Moreover, it fails to construct any meaningful sentence in the target language as it ignores the semantic properties of the target language. Therefore, it seems to fail to switch to the semantic rules of the target language and is instead projecting the semantics of the source language on the target language. For example, meaning of 'through thick and thin' (Seidl & McMordie, 1988) is 'through good times and difficult times, in all conditions' which is not in any way conveyed by the translation 'موٹے اور پتلے کے ذریعے', thus making the translation wrong and useless.

Ten English proverbs from (J. Seidl, 1988) (Speake, 2008) have been translated through BMT. Following are the generated results.

Table 2 English Proverbs

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
11.	Marriages are made in heaven.	شادیوں جنت میں ہوتی ہیں۔
12.	Laughter is the best medicine.	ہنسی بہترین دوا ہے۔
13.	Jack of all trades and master of none.	تمام تجارت کا جیک اور کسی کا ماسٹر نہیں۔
14.	As you sow, so you reap.	جیسا کہ آپ بونے ہیں، لہذا آپ کو کاٹنا پڑتا ہے۔
15.	Prevention is better than cure.	پرہیز علاج سے بہتر ہے۔
16.	United we stand, divided we fall.	متحد ہوں گے تو قائم رہیں گے، تقسیم ہوں گے تو شکست خوردہ ہوں گے۔
17.	Bad things come in threes.	بری چیزیں آتی ہیں۔
18.	A bad workman blames his tools.	ایک خراب کاریگر اپنے اوزار کو مورد الزام ٹھہراتا ہے۔
19.	Charity begins at home.	خیرات گھر سے شروع ہوتی ہے
20.	A barking dog never bites.	بھونکنے والا کتا کبھی نہیں کاٹتا۔

The eleventh proverb has been translated verbatim from English to Urdu although the correct translation is جوڑے آسمانوں پر بنتے ہیں۔ Moreover, the translation of the word 'marriages' is also wrong, showing how the software has trouble translating plural nouns. The twelfth proverb has also been translated word-to-word instead of translating it into corresponding Urdu proverb ہنسی علاج غم ہے۔ The translation of thirteenth proverb has several errors in it. It has transliterated the words "jack" and "master" into Urdu. Moreover, the tool has misinterpreted the whole meaning and has given the literal translation of the proverb. Similarly, in the fourteenth proverb, a

very common proverb has been translated as it is rather than in its corresponding Urdu proverb جو بوگے۔ وہ کاٹے۔ The translation of the fifteenth proverb is correct. In the sixteenth proverb, the software has not only literally translated the whole proverb to Urdu but has also changed the tense and expression. In the next example, the translation is literal as well as incomplete. The expression 'in threes' has not been translated at all and only the first part of the proverb has been translated. The last three examples also include verbatim translation instead of translation to corresponding Urdu proverbs.

*Investigating the Accuracy of Google
Translate in Translating Urdu Linguistic Elements*

For the next set of examples, ten Urdu idioms were taken from Phillott (1912) (Phillott, 1912) and translated

through Google Translate. The following table contains the obtained results.

Table 3 Urdu Idioms

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
21.	آسمان سے باتیں کرنا	Talking to the sky
22.	آسمان کے تارے توڑنا	Break the stars of the sky
23.	بھیگی بلی	Soaked pussy
24.	پانی پانی کرنا	Water to water
25.	پتھر کا دل	Heart of stone
26.	ٹیڑھی کھیر	Crooked pudding
27.	خاطر میں نہ لانا	Do not bring in the sake of
28.	خون سفید ہونا	Blood to be white
29.	دن پھرنا	To roam the day
30.	ذندہ درگور ہونا	To be mindful

In this table, examples 21, 22 and 23 have all been literally translated in English although their corresponding English idioms do exist. The translations do not make any sense and are therefore, semantically wrong. In the 24th example, the English translation is not only incorrect, but it has also changed the gerund کرنا to the preposition 'to'. The examples 25 and 26 are again cases of poor verbatim copy and a lack of rationalization has been observed in the latter. However, in the 27th example, the literal translation is also wrong. The negation verb نہ لانا has been changed into an imperative 'do not' showing the inaccuracy of the denotative meaning. In example 28, the translation makes no sense and lacks

clarity of meaning. In example 29, again a deficiency of meaning can be observed, resulting in an incorrect expression. In the 30th example, the translation is completely inappropriate and fails to provide the connotative meaning.

Here, ten Urdu proverbs have been taken from 'Famous Urdu Proverbs Translated into English', (2014) (Best Right Way, 2014) and were translated by Google Translate:

Table 4 Urdu Proverbs

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
31.	کھسیانی بلی کھمبا نوچے	Khasani cat poles dancing
32.	چھوٹا منہ بڑی بات	Small mouth big thing
33.	دور کے ڈھول سہانے	the grass is always greener from the other side
34.	دھوبی کا کتا نہ گھر کا نہ گھاٹ کا	Dhobi's dog neither the house nor the pier
35.	جیسی کرنی ویسی بھرنی	what goes around comes around
36.	جتنی چادر ہو اتنا پیر پھیلاو	Spread the legs as wide as possible
37.	اب پچھتائے کیا ہوت ، جب چڑیاں چگ گئیں کھیت	Now what would be the regrets, when the sparrows were consumed
38.	جو گرجتے ہیں وہ برستے نہیں	Those who roar do not fall
39.	لالچ بری بلا ہے	Greed is evil
40.	ڈوبتے کو تنکے کا سہارا	Resort to straw to drown

In the very 41st example, the word کھسیانی has been transliterated whereas the word نوچے has been wrongly translated as 'dancing'. In the 42nd example, the proverb has been translated verbatim and the translation of بات has been mistranslated as 'thing'. The 43rd example has been translated into the English proverb but lacks accuracy as the correct expression is 'grass is always greener on the other side', not 'from the other side'. The next proverb has also been incorrectly translated. The word دھوبی has been transliterated although possession has been shown with the help of '-s', while the rest of the proverb has been translated word-to-word. The fifth proverb has also been translated incorrectly. Although, this translation also corresponds to this proverb, still

the accurate translation is 'as you sow so shall you reap'. The next translation is entirely wrong as the English expression does make perfect sense but does not correspond to the Urdu proverb at all, rather holds a meaning quite opposite to the actual meaning which is to undertake only what one has the ability to do. The next translation is also an example of poor verbatim copy. The software has also changed the verb 'regret' to noun 'regrets' and the subject 'sparrows' has been converted into receiver of the action. The example shows poor sense of syntactic pattern of the software. The 48th proverb has also been translated word to word, and that too, incorrectly. The correct translation is 'barking dogs seldom bite'. Moreover, the word برستے has wrongly translated as 'fall'. The ninth proverb is again translated verbatim although the

correct translation should be 'avarice is the root of all evils. The last example also has a distorted verbatim translation whereas the correct translation is 'drowning man catches at straw'.

The following table contains a list of sentences mentioning different relations in Urdu and their translations by Google Translate.

Table 5 Relations

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
41.	وہ میرے نانا ہیں۔	He is my grandfather.
42.	وہ میرا بہنوئی ہے۔	He is my sister.
43.	یہ میرے خالو ہیں۔	This is my uncle.
44.	وہ میرے چچا کا بیٹا ہے۔	He is my uncle's son.
45.	وہ میری پھوپھی کا بیٹا ہے۔	She is my aunt's son.
46.	وہ میرا منہ بولا بھائی ہے۔	He is my brother.
47.	وہ میرا نندوئی ہے۔	That's my ninety.
48.	میں اس کا لے پالک بیٹا ہوں۔	I am his adopted son.
49.	وہ میرا خالہ زاد ہے۔	He is my cousin.
50.	وہ اس کے نانا کی بھانجی ہے۔	She is her grandfather's niece.

The first sentence has been translated as 'he is my grandfather' which is ambiguous as **نانا** is the maternal grandfather and the translation fails to mention that. In the 52nd example, the relation of **بہنوئی** has been mentioned which refers to 'brother-in-law' or more specifically, 'sister's husband' but the translation is totally incorrect, and the software has used 'he', a masculine pronoun to refer to 'sister', a feminine noun. The 53rd sentence also has the problem of ambiguity as the word **خالو** specifically refers to 'maternal aunt's husband' but it has been simply stated as 'uncle' leaving confusion and giving incomplete meaning. The 54th example again lacks complete information as it simply

translates **چچا کا بیٹا** to 'uncle's son', failing to state if the uncle is paternal or maternal. The 55th sentence has been mistranslated and the software has again juxtaposed a feminine pronoun 'she' with a masculine noun 'son'. Moreover, the translation of **پھوپھی** has been simply done as 'aunt' which fails to communicate whether it is maternal or paternal aunt. The 56th translation is an example of incomplete translation as the relation **منہ بولا بھائی** has been simply translated as the word 'brother' which is incorrect. The 57th example is of the relation of **نندوئی** who is 'sister-in-law's husband' or 'husband of one's husband's sister'. Google Translate fails to understand this word and mistranslates it to ninety, rendering the whole

sentence meaningless. The 58th sentence has been translated correctly. The 59th sentence is again translated incompletely as the word *خالہ زاد* has simply been translated to cousin without mentioning which cousin. The last translation has a surprisingly odd mistake as Google Translate

successfully translates all relations correctly but fails to translate the pronoun correctly. The pronoun *اس* is gender neutral in Urdu and can be used for both masculine and feminine pronouns but Translate restricts the translation to only 'her', classifying it as a feminine pronoun solely.

Table 6 Linguistic Elements

Sr. No.	Source Language	Target Language
51.	اس کا نام میرے نام پر رکھا گیا۔	It was named after me.
52.	وہ دانت نکال رہا تھا۔	He was pulling his teeth.
53.	اس نے پھول توڑا۔	He broke the flower.
54.	ستارے آسمان پر ہیں۔	The stars are in the sky.
55.	ڈاکٹر مریض کی نبض دیکھتا ہے۔	The doctor watches the patient's pulse.
56.	کبوتر کے پر کاٹ دو۔	Cut it on the pigeon.
57.	وہ جاتے جاتے رہ گیا۔	He kept on going.
58.	اس نے اس کو پانی پلایا۔	He gave her water.
59.	ناک صاف کرو۔	Clean the nose.
60.	نالے دانی لاؤ۔	Bring the umbilical cord.

The above table consists of examples regarding commonly used linguistic elements of Urdu language. Some of these include multiple third-person pronouns and others employ collocations. In the first example, the software translates “اس” to “it” although there is no indicator of whether “اس” refers to an animate or an inanimate object. In the 62nd example, the Urdu sentence correctly translates to “he was grinning” but Google translate has literally translated the expression *دانت نکال رہا تھا* to “pulling his teeth”. In the 63rd example, the word *توڑا* here means “plucked” but the

software wrongly translates it to “broke” regardless of the fact that the word has been used in another context. The 64th sentence has been translated correctly. The fifth example is again verbatim translation and fails to convey the correct meaning. The correct translation should be “The doctor checks the patient's pulse” but the software fails to take into account the collocations regarding the word *دیکھتا*. In the 66th example, the translation is incorrect as the software wrongly translates *پر* to “on” rather than “wings”. Google Translate fails yet

again to analyse the context of the word. The 67th example shows that the software has wrongly translated the Urdu sentence, resulting in complete loss of intended meaning. in the 68th example, the software translates the “اس” in the subject to “he” and “اس” in the object to “her” although there is no indicator of grammatical gender in the sentence. The 69th example again shows how Google Translate fails to understand the context of the word صاف and translates it to “clean” rather than “wipe”. In the last example, the word نالے دانی refers to a tool used for putting elastic in the shalwar. Due to cultural differences, there is no corresponding word for نالے دانی in English. Hence, Google Translate wrongly translates it to “umbilical cord”.

The major findings of this study show the different types of errors committed by the software. The software does not have several corresponding Urdu words in English and transliterates them, such as کھسیانی and دھوبی. Moreover, certain English words have also been transliterated to Urdu such as 'Jack' and 'Master'. The software also fails to maintain coherence among nouns and pronouns and lacks vocabulary regarding relations.

Major Findings

Major findings in this research are:

Semantic Errors: The translations include semantic errors which refer to the lack of meaning in translated

expressions and fail to produce meaningful sentences at times. Strictly considering the data above, the frequency of semantic errors in translation was 35% such that the whole expression was meaningless. Moreover, the frequency of partial errors where some sense of meaning is retained in translation and the error was only due to one-word errors was 8.33%. For instance, the expression “through thick and thin” was translated to موٹی اور پتلی کے ذریعے which does not have any meaning in Urdu language and چھوٹا منہ بڑی بات was translated to “small mouth big thing” where some meaning is conveyed but lack of use of appropriate words made it ambiguous.

Transliteration: Transliteration is the process of rewriting a word of a language in the alphabet of another language. The frequency of this error was 5% as there were only a few words in the above examples which Google Translate failed to translate. Whenever the software failed to recognize an Urdu word, it transliterated it from Urdu to English. For example, the words کھسیانی and دھوبی were transliterated to “khasani” and “dhobi” respectively.

Verbatim Translation: A verbatim translation is the word-to-word copy or translation of a word or

expression from one language to another. Google Translate carried out verbatim translation of majority of the idioms and proverbs, consequently losing the real meaning. the frequency of this error was 62.5% which is very high. For example, آسمان سے باتیں کرنا was translated verbatim as “talking to the sky” and “United we stand, divided we fall” as متحد ہوں گے تو قائم رہیں گے، تقسیم ہوں گے تو شکست خوردہ ہوں گے.

Grammatical Gender Problems: Urdu language is based on the use of grammatical gender due to which specific pronouns are used with certain nouns, based on their grammatical gender. Google Translate fails to account for this rule and incorrectly translates expressions. There was a 10% frequency of the error in which the software got the gender completely incorrect while 15% of the time it chose gender neutral terms in translation, making the results ambiguous. Some examples include وہ میری پھوپھی کا بیٹا ہے becomes “She is my aunt's son” and وہ میرا بہنوئی ہے is translated to “He is my sister”.

Lexical Limitations: English language lacks the equivalents of certain Urdu words due to socio-cultural differences. The software either fails to find the appropriate translation of certain words or simply does not have the required data. This

can be seen through the examples of words like نالے دانی, نندوئ and بہنوئ for which the software fails to provide appropriate meanings and instead comes up with wrong translations which are “umbilical cord”, “sister” and “ninety”, respectively. The frequency of this error was recorded to be 15%. There were also some partial errors where the software recognized the words from source language correctly but not completely such as “marriages” was translated to شادیوں and not شادیاں. The frequency of such errors, on the basis of the above data, was recorded to be 11.67%. Other times, it simply transliterates those words, for example, “master” remains ماسٹر, and دھوبی remains “dhobi”.

Misinterpretation by the Tool: Misinterpretation refers to error in understanding the whole expression. It sometimes results in devising a meaning quite opposite to the real meaning. This error is evident in the results as the software translates جتنی چادر ہو اتنا پیر پھیلاو to “spread the legs as wide as possible”.

Missing Syntactic Pattern: Google Translate failed several times to produce proper sentences during translation, thus resulted in poor syntactic patterns. For instance, ٹوہتے کو کا سہارا was translated to

“resort to straw to drown” which has no proper structure or meaning. Similarly, پانی پانی کرنا is translated to “water to water” which is an incomplete and meaningless expression.

English to Urdu and Urdu to English one-word translation was correct to some extent but it is not beneficial as one-word translation is least required by the users.

Conclusions

The aforementioned findings prove that Google Translate fails to accurately translate idioms, proverbs and many other commonly used linguistic elements correctly from Urdu to English and vice versa. Google Translation needs to be improved to acknowledge lexico-semantic elements, context and cultural connotations of words to translate idioms, proverbs and other linguistic expressions accurately. Besides, this analytical study would be beneficial in terms of improvement in efficiency of Google Translate as this study highlights translation errors which are responsible for deterioration of machine translation process. The application of machine translation in the translation of webpages, Skype conversations, Instagram captions, YouTube subtitles, Artificial Intelligence, conversations with robots in dialog system, reviews and comments on commercial websites has made it extremely necessary to be accurate. In addition, overall impact of Urdu language would be improved in

international community especially Pakistani Urdu variety will get more impetus and exposure. Furthermore, beneficiaries of this study would be translators, translation agencies and students of literature, linguistics and all other subjects. It will also be of great service to the learners of Urdu language. Further work needs to be done in order to improve the transfer of connotative meaning during the process of Neural Machine Translation of English-Urdu language pair, for the reason that “All translation is, and must be, the restitution of meaning” (Berman 2000, p. 297).

References

- AbdulMalik, A., & Habib, A. (2013). Urdu to English machine translation using bilingual evaluation understudy. *International Journal of Computer Applications*, 82(7), 5-12. doi:10.5120/14126-1040
- Ali, A., Hussain, A., & Malik, M. K. (n.d.). Model for English-Urdu Statistical Machine Translation. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 24(10), 1362-1367. doi:10.5829/idosi.wasj.2013.24.10.760
- Famous Urdu proverbs translated into English. (2014, April 16). Retrieved November 10, 2019, from <https://www.bestrighway.com/2014/04/famous-urdu-proverbs-translated-into.html>

- Hutchins, J. (1997). From first conception to first demonstration: the nascent years of machine translation, 1947-1954 A chronology. *Machine Translation*, 12(3), 195-252. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1007969630568>
- Jawaid, B., Kamran, A., & Bojar, O. (2014). English to Urdu statistical machine translation: Establishing a baseline. *Proceedings of the Fifth Workshop on South and Southeast Asian Natural Language Processing*, 37-42. doi:10.3115/v1/w14-5505
- Lee, J., Cho, K., & Hofmann, T. (2017). Fully character-level neural machine translation without explicit segmentation. *Transactions of the Association for Computational Linguistics*, 5, 365-378. doi:10.1162/tacl_a_00067
- Muzaffar, S., & Behera, P. (2018). A Qualitative Evaluation of Google's Translate: A Comparative Analysis of English-Urdu Phrase-based Statistical Machine Translation (PBSMT) and Neural Machine Translation (NMT) Systems. *Language in India*, 18, 154-163. Retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net/define/http%3A%2F%2Fwww.languageinindia.com%2F>
- Phillott, D. C., & Dihlavī, S. A. (1912). *Khazīna-E Muḥāwarāt: Or, Urdu idioms*. Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press.
- Seidl, J., & McMordie, W. (1988). *English idioms*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Speake, J., & Simpson, J. (2008). *A dictionary of proverbs* (6th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Trujillo, A. (1999). *Translation engines: Techniques for machine translation* (1st ed.). London: Springer-Verlag London.
- Venuti, L., Baker, M., & Berman, A. (2000). TRANSLATION AND THE TRIALS OF THE FOREIGN. In *The translation studies reader*. London: Psychology Press.
- Wu, Y., Schuster, M., Chen, Z., Le, Q. V., Norouzi, M., Macherey, W., ... Dean, J. (2016). Google's Neural Machine Translation System: Bridging the Gap between Human and Machine Translation.

Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'

¹*Aleena Hussain*

¹*Lahore Garrison University, Lahore, Pakistan*

Abstract

The debate regarding human morality and human conscience is a crucial part of history in the present and the future of humanity. This debate on what's in actuality is 'good' and right, and what is 'bad' or the evil is an integral part of philosophy, Be specific on the philosophy literature and basic ethical considerations. This research defines and differentiates between good actions and moralistic thoughts. For this purpose, Plato and Immanuel Kant were selected for the moralistic comparison. The philosophy of Kant regarding good and virtuous actions performed through free will and the shift from transcendental aesthetics towards transcendental logic is observed and compared with the theories presented by Plato. Plato details the movement of human morals and intellectuality from sheer ignorance towards knowledge or the intellectual realm with the analogy of the Cave and the Simile of the Divided Line. This moralistic comparison is drawn through the moral analysis on the text of Oedipus the King by Sophocles. This research concludes that although the two philosophies diverge and differ in their perspectives of the good but strive for man to achieve and attain the 'good' and wisdom. However, this research is limited in the sense that not all the angles of these philosophers' theories were analyzed and some parts of the text under consideration was left untouched. This research is open for further study.

Keywords: Moralistic Comparison, Moral Analysis, Plato, Immanuel Kant, Oedipus, Philosophy

Author's Email: aleenah87@gmail.com

Introduction

Good, in English, is derived from the German word 'Gut' which suggests anything beneficial or desirable. Throughout History and learning, man is trying to discover and decide what exactly is to be good and what are the acts that pertain to the

concept of good. Aristotle determines human history good is taken for the "activity of the soul in accordance with virtue" (12) whereas G. E. Moore describes 'good' as a simple notion that "states what are the parts which invariably compose a certain whole" (10). Similarly, philosophers like Plato and Kant have come up with diverging

*Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's
and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'*

ideas and the theories discerning the belief in what is 'good'. My goal in this paper is to highlight the distinct philosophies on the ideas of 'good' presented by Plato and Immanuel Kant and use a literary text to observe the practical application of these theories.

For this purpose, I have divided my paper into six sections for an effective moral analysis. The first and second sections of my paper highlight Plato's theory of 'good' and relate it with the literary text of *Oedipus the King* written by Sophocles. The third and fourth sections of this research discuss Immanuel Kant's philosophy of 'good' and apply it to the same literary text. Furthermore, the fifth section illuminates the evident similarities and differences of the ideas of good that become apparent within the textual analysis. Afterwards, the six-section concludes the overall research.

Plato's Form of Good

Plato was a renowned disciple of Socrates and a teacher of Aristotle. Among the myriad of theories of Plato, his Theory of Forms presents a pivotal understanding of the ideal and the good. Plato illustrates this concept further by the Allegory of a Cave and the Simile of the Divided Line.

Plato in his *The Republic* presents a Theory of Forms which represents the absolute, universal and ultimate forms of abstract concepts like beauty and good. A form is the innate and purest essence of an object. For example, an object of wood has a pure and universal form of woodiness and a

beautiful object contains an essence and a pure beauty in it. Similarly, a good act or thing will have a core value of goodness in it. Although Plato did not directly give a definition of 'good', he describes in detail how to achieve the form of good.

In the "Allegory of the Cave," it is imagined that humanity is tied up in a dark cave where the only iota of light can be visible from the end of a very narrow, long tunnel. The prisoners are shackled since birth and their hands are also fastened so they cannot really see each other or turn sideways. They have been tied since their childhood facing a big wall. Behind them is an enormous fire that casts shadows on the wall. The bound prisoners have only these shadows to educate and entertain themselves; therefore, they have given names to these shadows and determine the shadowy images to be the real objects. Nevertheless, one of the prisoners somehow managed to break the chains tied around him and view his surroundings for the first time. At first, he was befuddled by the light of the fire and this confusion would make him want to return to captivity again. However, with time he will become accustomed and make his way to the end of the tunnel and reach the outside world where the brilliant light of the sun will make him very disoriented and utterly bewildered. Though when the prisoner starts to view, interpret and understand the real objects around him and along with their shadows, he will slowly start to educate and learn. He will be able to comprehend the reflections of the sun, the actual objects

and ultimately be able to look at the sun. This will lead him to the comprehension of how the world exists and governs. The prisoner would want to go back into the cave and educate his fellows. When he tries to explain to them the workings of the seasons and the forces of the world, he gets mocked and taunted by the bound prisoners who deem him as delusional and having mental problems. If the prisoners were somehow able to free themselves, they would have killed the freed prisoner for his revolutionary and rebellious ideas. This Allegory of the Cave connotes the idea of gaining education and awareness, and in attaining the form of good.

Everything that exists in this material world is the imperfect copies or imitations of the perfect and ideal concepts and ideas present in our minds. The shadowy images that the bound prisoners notice are held in the visible realm of understanding. The visible realm is also known as the physical realm where you assume the objects by use of the five basic senses of sight and sound. The physical realm that leads to the development of 'opinion' is divided into two categories of images and objects. We view the images, reflections, shadows and pictures that lead to the formation of one's ideology based on conjecture and imagination. While the actual objects, like animals, plants or manufactured things, that we view formulate our belief and trust.

On the other hand, an intellectual realm exists based on our

perceptions and intuition. This realm is divided into the lower order and higher order of understanding. The lower-order thought is free from conjecture as transient thinking established by guesses and hypotheses leads to the construction of definitions of abstract and ideal concepts of beauty, justice, ideal squares and mathematical speculations etc. This is the platform where we start forming ground knowledge and our opinions alter into knowledge as Plato says, "Haven't you noticed that all opinions without knowledge are ugly? The best of them are blind." (Book VI, 506c). While in the higher-order of understanding knowledge morphs into wisdom as meticulous intellectual reasoning is used to comprehend actual truths like the essence of beauty or the form of good. This is explained by the Simile of the Divided Line. To achieve the true form of good and wisdom, the individual has to rise along with the divisions of the visible world from illusion and belief to the reason and intellection of the intelligible realm.

Plato relates the form of good with knowledge and wisdom. The dark cave represents the real visible world where the light comes from the fire which symbolizes the sun. When the prisoner leaves the cave and sees the sun, this is a metaphorical climb of the soul from the visible realm to the intelligible realm to attain the real form of good and wisdom. The sun keeps us alive as we see the visible world around us. This enabled sight and light of the sun and is a symbolic representation of the intellect or the good that facilitates

*Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's
and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'*

the growth of life and knowledge of further concepts of truth, justice and beauty. Attaining the highest form of good leads one to the path of other positive things like justice and virtue, "...with considerable effort, is the idea of the good; but once seen, it must be concluded that this is, in fact, the cause of all that is right and fair in everything" (Book VII, 517b-c).

**The Application of Plato's
Philosophy in Oedipus the King**

The philosophy of Plato can be clearly discerned in Oedipus the King written by Sophocles. Oedipus Rex is the person who murders his father and marries his mother unknowingly as foretold by a prophecy. Ultimately, he blinds himself deliberately after becoming aware of his wretched actions. This journey of Oedipus from metaphorical blind ignorance to the path of knowledge is an evident depiction of Plato's Allegory of the Cave as seen in what follows.

At the start of the play, Oedipus Rex displays his ignorance and cluelessness in the murder of Laius. He exclaims, "And where are they? In what country? Where am I to find a trace of this ancient crime? It will be hard to track" (127-129). Here, he is similar to one of those prisoners bound in the cave who base all their understanding of the world on mere reflections and shadows cast by the fire behind them. They live in a world of darkness and imagination. It can be rightly inferred that Oedipus exists in the conjecture where his existence is based upon thoughts and

shadowy reflections. Similarly, Oedipus has limited knowledge of the world around him including the murder of Laius, his wife's ex-husband, and limited knowledge of his own origins. In his unfamiliarity with the truth, Oedipus assumes Merope to be his mother and Polybois to be his real father he was destined to kill. Oedipus symbolizes those "[Men trapped in the cave] would hold that the truth is nothing other than the shadows of artificial things" (Book VII, 515c).

When Tiresias, an individual who has attained the highest form of good and enlightenment, tries to tell Oedipus the truth, Oedipus refuses to listen and believe him. This scene depicts the ignorant prisoners who get taught by the freed prisoner but turn to laugh, taunt and insult him. They take him to be a delusional and unthinking person who speaks nonsense the manner Oedipus calls Tiresias, "You dare utter shameful words like this?" (422).

When Jocasta seemingly becomes conscious that the truth about Oedipus parentage will be revealed, she tries to dissuade him from further inquiry saying, "Listen to me, I beg you. Do not do this" (1276). Later when she cannot grasp the full horror the truth unveils; she commits suicide as a way of escape from the pain. Just as a prisoner from the dark cave is released and is made to face the fire, the prisoner desires vainly to return to captivity and away from the burning truth or light.

The dialogue in Oedipus,

"Lady, as I listen to these words of yours, my soul is shaken, my mind confused..." (875) is likened to the idea when the prisoner was freed and made to face the light of the fire. The prisoner was disoriented, worried and confused upon seeing real objects and the source of light that had made him see the shadowy images as actual things. This is the stage where Oedipus seems to have formed a 'belief' in the physical realm of understanding upon seeing the 'object' or in this case learning the facts relating to Laius' murder.

When Oedipus is at the brink of hearing the dreadful truth and fact of his parentage from the shepherd and former royal slave, he exclaims "And I'm about to hear it. But nonetheless, I have to know this" (1400). He appears highly reluctant and scared to know the details but his curiosity and moral duty compel him to listen. This is similar to the startled and inquisitive spirit of the freed prisoner who is dragged out of the dark cave and made to face the light and the real objects. The prisoner is at first completely baffled from the powerful light of the sun but has to look around his surroundings to make sense of the world. He slowly adjusts to the brightness and starts conceiving his own definitions and interpretations of the real objects before him. Here Oedipus assumes the stage of the lower order of the intellectual realm where he starts forming thoughts based on gathered knowledge rather than on opinions and conjectures.

After learning the truth from the shepherd, Oedipus bellows as "Ah, so it

all came true. It's so clear now. O light, let me look at you one final time, a man who stands revealed as cursed by birth, cursed by my own family, and cursed by murder where I should not kill" (1418-1422). This is the point where the prisoner or in this case, the prisoner of fate, Oedipus Rex achieves a complete perception of the world. Here he stares the truth in the eye and the metaphorical sun that shed light on his fate and actions. He attains the higher order of the intelligible realm where his knowledge turns to wisdom. Such wisdom that only the true philosophers attain. Oedipus becomes informed of the true essence of good, truth and fate. This knowledge of the truth and good further cultivates the knowledge of justice in him as he blinds himself to atone for his ignorant sins. Additionally, by this act, Oedipus assumes the physical form of blindness even as he was once metaphorically blind by ignorance.

Oedipus Rex also proves himself to be a capable guardian of Thebes when he assures the citizens of his concern to help them at a difficult time by declaring, "But the soul inside me sorrows for myself, and for the city, and for you-all together" (73). These lines indicate the passionate and sympathetic personality of a guardian of a state ought to be as suggested by Plato in his book, *The Republic*. Moreover, Oedipus fulfills his promise to the citizens of Thebes by banishing himself from the state and bringing justice to the murderer of Laius for the good of the state as he requests, "Send me away to live outside of Thebes"

*Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's
and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'*

(1793). This sense of justice comes from the sense of viewing oneself with impartiality and fairness that Oedipus comes to possess after blinding himself. This act of justice and good corresponds to the idea presented by Plato, "Then the just man will not be any different from the just city with respect to the form itself of justice, but will be like it" (Book IV, 435b).

The ignorant and sinful life of Oedipus represents the immaterial world of the dark cave. The fire or the mission of finding Laius' killer represents the sun which gives light to ascent for higher knowledge and education. This ascension or Oedipus' search for his roots, leads him to the sun which represents the ultimate form of good and truth of the fate and destiny of Oedipus. The Form of the Good is important as Plato asserts in *The Republic*, "provided truth and intelligence-and that the man who is going to act prudently in private or in public must see it" (Book VII, 517c). After being acquainted with the purest form of good and truth, Oedipus not only acts in a sensible and good way with himself but also his family and the state for Oedipus blinds himself to in a way deliver justice for his crimes. Additionally, Oedipus urges Creon to look after and care for his daughters when he would not be around to aid them. Here, he accepts Creon as the guardian of Thebes. Oedipus benefits the state of Thebes by exiling himself to purge the city of its terrible plague and to atone for the murder of Thebes' former ruler, Laius.

Kant's Concept of Good.

Immanuel Kant who was born during the Enlightenment Age presented the concept of morality which states that moral values can only be achieved through acting upon the nature of categorical imperative, goodwill and the notion of duty. Imperatives are essential commands or maxims. For Kant, there exist two important imperatives namely 'categorical imperative' and 'hypothetical imperative'. The hypothetical imperative is based on thoughts as the individual is placed in front of the thoughts and ideas which make the individual more prone to corruption and self-interest. For example, when you say "I will tell the truth" and you have to pause and ponder about your actions instead of doing them. On the other hand, the categorical imperative or unconditional command is based on actions as the ideas are put in front of the individual which makes him less prone to corruption. For example, when you say "I must tell the truth" and you perform the act of good without thinking or delaying it. The categorical imperative is to be upheld at all times irrespective of the circumstances, meaning one must act in a good and ethical way regardless of the demands of the situation.

This imperative presents two important formulations; the universalizability principle and the formula of humanity. The universal formula states that you have to act and will as in such a way that it implies to the rest of the world equally. This

maxim state, "Act as if the maxim of your action were to secure through your will a universal law of nature". For example, telling a lie will result in all of humanity lying and deceiving whereas telling the truth will follow the universal rule of honesty. Whereas the humanity formula states that 'Act in such a way that you treat humanity, whether in your own person or the person of another, always as an end and never simply as a means'. This illustrates the view that we should not assume people as a means of acquiring a use out of them but consider them as individuals who have their own sense of aspirations, goals and work ahead of them. This is consistent with the idea of always hatching a good example for others through righteous actions.

These formulations can be applied by the notion of duty towards oneself and the duties towards others which are self-preservation and strict obligations for performing the good acts. The good acts can only be performed from the will to be good. This will to be good if undertaken with free leads to morality. Basically, the acts based on goodwill performed with a free will comes from the virtue of oneself. The acts and work we do from goodwill and no other reason besides the intention of doing good matters. The actions we perform out of the respect for the moral values through free will are the actions reflecting goodness and virtue. Virtue is parallel to being happy and contented and this is the highest good that humans can attain. A virtuous person has the strength and self-respect to resist bodily inclinations

and act upon the good principles with free will because it is simply the right thing to do. Our moral reasoning is in constant conflict with our passionate desires and it is up to us to act on our goodwill. To lead a good life, our chaotic feelings of transcendental aesthetics should be transformed into logical thought or transcendental logic. This happens when we realize that our mind has the control over our body or as the phrase goes 'mind over matter'.

Relevance of Kant's Concept of Good to Oedipus the King

Oedipus Rex emerges to be a caring, concerned and compassionate ruler of Thebes as he appears to be solicitous for his subjects in their time of need. At his first arrival into Thebes, he fends off the dreaded sphinx and frees the people. He worries for his people during the plague as he tries to find a cure and to bring to justice the killer of the former guardian of Thebes, Laius. Later, he learns the truth about his parentage and exiles himself from the city as a form of justice.

When the people of Thebes lament in front of Oedipus about the terrible plague, Oedipus bemoans his own anguish and grief and feels deeply for the people and the ailing city in the words, "But the soul inside me sorrows for myself, and for the city, and for you-all together" (74-75). This feeling of affliction and despair is a testament to Kant's ideas of morality, righteousness and goodwill outside the aspect of religion. Oedipus who is the ruler and king of Thebes, can get whatever he

*Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's
and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'*

desires but still feels the pain for his people in their time of desperation. In his quest to find the cure, though in ignorance, he vows to bring forth the murderer of Laius the pollutant that produced the plague. He assumes himself to be the son and heir of Laius that will fight on his behalf and get justice as he states, "So now I will fight on his behalf as if this matter concerned my father, and I will strive to do everything I can to find him..." (309-310).

This sense of justice and goodwill is, however, tainted with the hypothetical imperative as Oedipus does not only want justice for the sick city or the former king but also to save and protect his life from any possible future assassination attack on him. The sense of protection and self-interest of Oedipus, kingship and the power that comes from being the ruler of Thebes is a subsequent reason in unmasking the killer as Oedipus announces, "For whoever killed this man may soon enough desire to turn his hand in the same way against me, too, and kill me. Thus, in avenging Laius, I serve myself" (167-170). Moreover, by getting rid of the plague and uncovering the loose killer of a former king just as he once defeated the Sphinx, Oedipus Rex stands to assert and solidify his power and dominance once more in Thebes. This ulterior motive of Oedipus is hinted at through his words, "Then I will start afresh and once again shed light on darkness" (159).

Just as the truth is about to be revealed, Jocasta sensing the disastrous

repercussions, requests Oedipus to stop his relentless investigation into the matter in the words, "Listen to me, I beg you. Do not do this" (1275-1276). Moreover, the summoned Servant also hesitates in answering Oedipus' questions and does not reveal the information until he is threatened as he murmurs, "And if I do, there's an even greater chance that I'll be killed" (1398). This hesitation and reluctance in hiding and dissuading from finding the truth is a direct negation of the universal maxim of the categorical imperative of truth and honesty, and the notion of duty towards others.

Since Oedipus killed his father, although, in ignorance, he committed the act of murder and sin through his own free will. This is a direct contradiction of goodwill and the categorical imperative of good. As it becomes clear to Oedipus and the entire city that Oedipus was the one behind Laius' death and the cause of the plague, he must leave the city. Oedipus requests Creon for help in sheltering and providing for his two daughters in the words, "You are a relative of theirs- don't let them sink to lives of desperation like my own" (1778). Jocasta committed suicide and Oedipus is bound to leave the city for forever. This leaves their daughters who are young and cannot fend for themselves to be dependent on the mercy of their uncle Creon to care for them. Their father would always be a symbol of shame wherever they turn to in the society. They would be cast out of the social gatherings, people would talk behind their backs and no respectable

man would marry them due to the fact of their sinful birth. Oedipus understands and foresees all these misfortunes that would befall his daughters; therefore, he pleads with Creon to protect and provide for them. The very Creon whom Oedipus had once accused of betrayal and treachery. This concern and worry of the doting father represent the notion of fatherly duty and attainment of self-respect in regretting, recognizing and accepting the faults of one.

Oedipus entreats Creon to banish and expel him from Thebes by saying, "Send me away to live outside of Thebes" (1793). This utterance indicates humility and self-awareness that Oedipus has attained after the revelation of the truth and metaphorically attained the light of the wisdom. He is proposing to exile himself in order to get rid of the pollution that he is in the form of the plague from the city. It also signifies the fulfillment of the promise that Oedipus had made to bring justice to the murderer of Laius. Oedipus' acts of leaving the city and concern for his daughters implies the freedom of goodwill, notion of duty and commitment towards oneself and others, selfless act of good, the categorical imperative of fulfilling pledges and fatherly affection towards his daughters in line with Kant's philosophy?

The act of self-exile also reflects the spiritual growth in Oedipus Rex. He runs away from Corinth on a mere impulse without investigating the

prophecy that he heard. Then he slays Laius and his men in a glimmer of rage. He relentlessly pursues the investigation into his own parentage regardless of the warnings of Tiresias, Jocasta and the Servant as he declares, "I will not be convinced I should not learn the whole truth of what these facts amount to" (1278). This unabashed curiosity and impulsiveness result in his doom and banishment. Nevertheless, Oedipus' acceptance of the exile and the act of blinding himself is a reflection of his conversion of irrational desires and transcendental aesthetics into rational thought and transcendental logic.

Comparison of Plato's and Kant's Philosophies.

Plato and Immanuel Kant have presented unique and diverging approaches to morality and the idea of 'good'. Plato has associated the good with wisdom in attaining knowledge and understanding as the true form of goodness. This form of goodness further leads to other ethical and pure issues that could lead to truth and justice. Whereas Kant believes that the good comes from within a person when he or she performs good act from his/her own free will. This act of good is mainly a duty towards oneself and others while realizing self-respect and virtue.

Plato asserts that the good comes while moving from the physical realm towards the mental realm of understanding as illustrated by the example of the Allegory of the Cave.

*Oedipus Rex: In the Light of Kant's
and Plato's Ideas of 'Good'*

This process may take quite some time. While for Kant, the good is inherent and it is up to the person to do the right or wrong thing according to his understanding.

The ethical philosophy of Immanuel Kant is deontological and normative as it renders a set of rules to be followed universally. This conception neither takes into account the different circumstances that individuals have to face nor the distinct personality and different intentions that each individual possesses. This makes Kant's ideology quite idealistic, rigid, lacking in emotions, and at times hard to follow instinctively. Plato's philosophy is generally descriptive as it presents the moral and noble systems for groups and societies. Plato provides a guideline in the Allegory of the Cave and Theory of Forms for individuals to follow at their own pace.

Plato's philosophy is chiefly concerned with the individual and how an individual can lead a good life. Kant on the contrary focuses on the actions and deeds of a man. The two philosophies are concerned about morality, goodness and ethical aspects in leading a virtuous life. The two philosophers strive to ascertain man's reach into 'reason' and 'understanding' in their conceptions of 'good'.

Conclusions

The evaluation of the two philosophies has shown that Plato and Immanuel Kant differ in their perspectives and approaches. On the

whole, they focus on attaining the quality of "good" and the doing of what is right and moralistic. Both philosophies present a structural part for man's gradual reach and ascension towards 'reason' to attain the conception of morality, virtue and good.

This research is open for further study. Through the conducted research it is recommended that these ideologies should be studied in detail and applied to other literary texts for better understanding and gaining moral values to cultivate human thought and perception.

Reference

- Crisp, Roger, editor. *Aristotle: Nicomachean Ethics*. Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Moore, George Edward. *Principia Ethica*. Barnes & Noble Publishing, 2005.
- Bloom, Allan. *The Republic of Plato*. Translated, with notes and an interpretive essay. New York: Basic Books, 1991.
- Beck, Lewis White. *A Commentary on Kant's Critique of Practical Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1960.
- Johnson, Robert and Adam Cureton, "Kant's Moral Philosophy", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Spring 2019

Edition. Edward N. Zalta (ed.),
7 July 2016,
[https://plato.stanford.edu/archi
ves/spr2019/entries/kant-
moral/](https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2019/entries/kant-moral/).

Gentzler, Jyl. (2005). "How to Know
the Good: The Moral
Epistemology of Plato's
Republic". *Philosophical
Reviews*. vol. 114, pp. 469-496.
10.1215/00318108-114-4-469.

Cover Letter

The authors are requested to send a cover letter along with their manuscripts. The cover letter should include the following features.

Mention the details of the main author, co-author(s) and corresponding author(s) for future correspondence

Name (Main author)/ (Co- author(s))/ Corresponding author)

Designation

Department

Institution (current)

E-mail address (es)

Mobile number

- a. Forward a statement declaring that all contributing authors are in agreement with the order of authorship and content of the manuscript.
- b. Mention any specific details about the manuscript (title, length in words, number of tables and figures, etc.).
- c. Provide information regarding any previous presentation of the data (e.g. conference presentation, thesis).
- d. Forward a statement declaring that the manuscript contains original, primary work which is not previously published or under consideration for publication elsewhere.
- e. Forward a statement that the manuscript does not contain any interpretation that may directly hurt any section of the community on the basis of race, religion or socio-cultural aspects.

Copyright

JELLE is published by the Department of English Language and Literature, Faculty of Languages, Lahore Garrison University, Pakistan. The copyright of all the materials published in JELLE rests with the Department of English Language and Literature, Faculty of Languages, Lahore Garrison University Lahore, Pakistan. The papers published by JELLE solely mirror the interpretations of the author(s). The Editorial Board or the publishing authority is neither responsible for the accuracy of the content nor they necessarily agree with the ideas presented in the papers.

Reference Style

The authors are recommended to follow **APA manual, 6th or MLA 8th edition** for guidelines regarding in-text citations and reference list. The authors must ensure that all the references cited in the text also exist in the reference list (and vice-versa) as well.

Please consult the guide on APA (<http://www.apastyle.org/>) or MLA (<https://www.mla.org>) referencing style.

Submission Checklist

The authors must review the '**Checklist for Manuscript Submission**' (APA manual, 6th edition or MLA 8th edition) before submitting their work to JELLE).

Instructions for Authors

The authors are requested to submit their research papers as an email attachment and send to Email address: jelle@lgu.edu.pk

Manuscript preparation

The authors are required to follow the instructions for the preparation of the manuscripts:

- Follow JELLE Research Paper guidelines for the write up of research papers.
- Mention the identity on the title page only.
- The **Title page** (page 1) must include information about:
 - a) Title
 - b) Running head
 - c) Author by line
 - d) Institutional affiliation
 - e) Corresponding author's details
 - f) Author note as indicated in APA manual, 6th edition
- Write an **Abstract** of 200-250 words (Page 2) words with maximum 5 keywords.
- The **Introduction** must start on the next page (Page 3).
- The tables, figures, charts, etc. must be on one page instead of continuing to the next page.
- The **References** and **Appendices** must start on separate pages.

Follow **APA manual 6th edition**(<http://www.apastyle.org/>), or **MLA 8th edition**. (<https://www.mla.org>).

- a) Follow a uniform typeface- Times New Roman, with 12-point font size
- b) The whole manuscript should be single-spaced.
- c) Follow APA/MLA manual for formatting, margins, layout, line length and alignment, paragraphs and indentations, special characters, page numbers and running heads, spelling checks etc.
- The recommended approximate length of the manuscript should range between **4000 to 8000 words** (excluding references, tables, figures and appendices).
- Follow either British or American English consistently throughout the manuscript without switching from one to another.
- JELLE team does not take any liability of the authors' opinions. The perceptions, views, and beliefs presented in published paper(s) are solely the responsibility of the author(s).
- JELLE has a very firm policy against plagiarism or self-plagiarism.



Faculty of Languages, Department of English
LAHORE GARRISON UNIVERSITY Lahore, Pakistan